

## 2. Melka Tuchi Small Scale irrigation Project

|   | Name of The Contractors                             | Eligibility |                      |                  |                                                                   |                          |                                     |                                                                       |                    |                    |                              | Verification                                                          |                                             |                              |                     |                                           | Completeness of bid |                 | Substantial Responsiveness             |               |                                              | OVER ALL |                               |
|---|-----------------------------------------------------|-------------|----------------------|------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|-------------------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------|----------------------------------------|---------------|----------------------------------------------|----------|-------------------------------|
|   |                                                     | Nationality | Conflict of interest | Bank Eligibility | State-Owned Enterprise or institution of the borrower country law | United Nation Resolution | History of non-performing contracts | Suspension based on execution of bid securing declaration by Employer | Pending litigation | Litigation History | VAT Registration Certificate | Valid Trade license or Business organization Registration Certificate | Valid Tax Clearance Certificate for 2018 EC | EGP registration certificate | Original Site Visit | Renewed for 2018 E.C construction license | Bid Security        | signed & sealed | No. of copy, technical& financial doc. | Letter of Bid | Declaration of Environmental and Social (ES) |          | Declaration/Power of attorney |
| 1 | Dedefo Tenesho GC&WW/CGC JV with Shodeb Engineering | R           | R                    | R                | R                                                                 | R                        | R                                   | R                                                                     | R                  | R                  | R                            | R                                                                     | R                                           | R                            | R                   | R                                         | R                   | R               | R                                      | NR            | NR                                           | R        | NR                            |
| 2 | Wada Engineering PLC                                | R           | R                    | R                | R                                                                 | R                        | R                                   | R                                                                     | R                  | R                  | R                            | R                                                                     | R                                           | R                            | R                   | R                                         | R                   | R               | R                                      | R             | R                                            | R        | R                             |
| 3 | Gudetu Construction PLC                             | R           | R                    | R                | R                                                                 | R                        | R                                   | R                                                                     | R                  | R                  | R                            | R                                                                     | R                                           | R                            | R                   | R                                         | R                   | R               | R                                      | R             | R                                            | R        | R                             |
| 4 | Alet Construction                                   | R           | R                    | R                | R                                                                 | R                        | R                                   | R                                                                     | R                  | R                  | R                            | R                                                                     | R                                           | R                            | R                   | R                                         | R                   | R               | R                                      | R             | R                                            | R        | R                             |
| 5 | Zewdu Lema General construction                     | R           | R                    | R                | R                                                                 | R                        | R                                   | R                                                                     | R                  | R                  | R                            | R                                                                     | R                                           | R                            | R                   | R                                         | R                   | R               | R                                      | R             | R                                            | R        | R                             |
| 6 | ETWO General contractor                             | R           | R                    | R                | R                                                                 | R                        | R                                   | R                                                                     | R                  | R                  | R                            | R                                                                     | R                                           | R                            | R                   | R                                         | R                   | R               | R                                      | R             | R                                            | R        | R                             |
| 7 | Walabu Construction                                 | R           | R                    | R                | R                                                                 | NR                       | NR                                  | NR                                                                    | NR                 | R                  | R                            | R                                                                     | R                                           | R                            | R                   | R                                         | R                   | R               | R                                      | NR            | R                                            | R        | NR                            |



FSRP | BID EVALUATION REPORT

|    | Name of The Contractors       | Eligibility |                      |                  |                                                                   |                          |                                     |                                                                       |                    | Verification       |                              |                                                                       |                                             |                              | Completeness of bid |                                           | Substantial Responsiveness |   |                 |                                    | OVER ALL |               |                                              |                               |    |
|----|-------------------------------|-------------|----------------------|------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|-------------------------------------------|----------------------------|---|-----------------|------------------------------------|----------|---------------|----------------------------------------------|-------------------------------|----|
|    |                               | Nationality | Conflict of interest | Bank Eligibility | State-Owned Enterprise or institution of the borrower country law | United Nation Resolution | History of non-performing contracts | suspension based on execution of bid securing declaration by Employer | Pending litigation | Litigation History | VAT Registration Certificate | Valid Trade license or Business organization Registration Certificate | Valid Tax Clearance Certificate for 2018 EC | EGP registration certificate | Original Site Visit | Renewed for 2018 E.C construction license | Bid Security               |   | signed & sealed | No. of copy, technical& final doc. |          | Letter of Bid | Declaration of Environmental and Social (ES) | Declaration/Power of attorney |    |
| 8  | Girma Urgessa WWC&BC          | R           | R                    | R                | R                                                                 | R                        | R                                   | R                                                                     | R                  | R                  | R                            | R                                                                     | R                                           | R                            | R                   | R                                         | R                          | R | R               | R                                  | R        | R             | R                                            | R                             | R  |
| 9  | Hinjigu Aboma GC & WWC        | R           | R                    | R                | R                                                                 | NR                       | NR                                  | R                                                                     | NR                 | NR                 | R                            | R                                                                     | R                                           | R                            | R                   | R                                         | R                          | R | R               | R                                  | R        | NR            | R                                            | NR                            | NR |
| 10 | Kassahun Million construction | R           | R                    | R                | R                                                                 | R                        | R                                   | R                                                                     | R                  | R                  | R                            | R                                                                     | R                                           | R                            | R                   | R                                         | R                          | R | R               | R                                  | R        | R             | R                                            | R                             | R  |

*[Handwritten signatures and marks]*



### Kassahun Million Construction

- The Letter of Bid was altered.

As ITB 12.1 the Letter of Bid shall be prepared using the relevant forms furnished in Section IV, Bidding Forms. The forms must be completed without any alterations to the text, and no substitutes shall be accepted except as provided under ITB 20.2. All blank spaces shall be filled in with the information requested.

### Hinjigu Aboma GC&WWC

- History of non-performing contracts was not submitted using Form CON-2.
- Pending litigation information was not submitted using Form CON-2.
- Litigation history was not submitted using Form CON-2.
- The Environmental, Social, Health and Safety (ESHS) past-performance declaration was not submitted using Form CON-3.
- The bidder did not submit the required site-visit evidence.
- The Letter of Bid identified an adjudicator, whereas the Bidding Document states that an adjudicator is not applicable.

As ITB 12.1 the Letter of Bid shall be prepared using the relevant forms furnished in Section IV, Bidding Forms. The forms must be completed without any alterations to the text, and no substitutes shall be accepted except as provided under ITB 20.2.

### Dedefo Tenesho GC & WWC GC JV with Shodeb Engineering

was found non-responsive during the preliminary examination due to non-compliance with the mandatory requirements of the Bidding Document. The bidder incorrectly completed the Letter of Bid by identifying an adjudicator, although the Bidding Document specifies that an adjudicator is not applicable. Furthermore, the bidder failed to submit the required Environmental and Social Declaration in accordance with the bidding requirements, including the applicable submission requirements for joint venture members. Consequently, the bidder failed to meet the preliminary requirements of the Bidding Document and was rejected at this stage.

### Walabu Construction

- The required United Nations Resolution declaration was not submitted.
- History of non-performing contracts was not submitted.
- The required information concerning suspension based on execution of a Bid-Securing Declaration by an Employer was not submitted.
- Pending litigation information was not submitted.



- Litigation history was not submitted.
- The Environmental and Social (ES) past-performance declaration was not submitted.
- The Letter of Bid was altered.

As ITB 12.1 the Letter of Bid shall be prepared using the relevant forms furnished in Section IV, Bidding Forms. The forms must be completed without any alterations to the text, and no substitutes shall be accepted except as provided under ITB 20.2. All blank spaces shall be filled in with the information requested.

Accordingly, Wada Engineering PLC, Gudetu Construction PLC, Alet Construction, Girma Assefa Urgessa WWC&BC, Zewudu Lemma General Construction and ETWO General Contractor were determined responsive at this stage and proceeded to detailed technical evaluation.



## 2. Melka Tuchi SSIP technical evaluation

| No.    | Evaluation Criteria                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Number | Wada Engineering PLC | Gudetu Construction PLC | Alet Construction | Girma Assefa Urgessa WWC&BC | Zewudu Lemma General construction | ETWO General contractor |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------|----------------------|-------------------------|-------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------|
| 3.1    | Financial Capabilities                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |        |                      |                         |                   |                             |                                   |                         |
| 3.1.1  | Cash at hand (2,000,000 ETB)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |        | R                    | R                       | NR                | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
| 3.1.2  | Credit facility (4,000,000)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |        | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
| 3.1.3  | Audit report for five past years                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |        | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
| 3.2    | Average Annual construction turnover (50,000,000)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |        | R                    | NR                      | NR                | R                           | R                                 | NR                      |
| 4.1(a) | General experience (Starting from July 8, 2020 up to July 8, 2025 for last 5 years the bidder must have completion experience of at least 1 project with value of 95,000,000 birr and above or 2 projects each with the value of birr 47,500,000 successfully completed.) with a clear verifiable testimonial documents (Agreement Document, Completion Certificate Letter & Final Payment Certificate) |        | R                    | NR                      | NR                | R                           | NR                                | NR                      |



| No.    | Evaluation Criteria                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Number | Wada Engineering PLC | Gudetu Construction PLC | Alet Construction | Girma Assefa Urgessa WWC&BC | Zewudu Lemma General construction | ETWO General contractor |
|--------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------|----------------------|-------------------------|-------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------|
| 4.2(a) | <b>Specific experience</b> (In the past 5 years the bidder must have completion experience of at least 1 water works, Irrigation works and different hydraulic structures projects with amount of 95,000,000 or 2 water works or Irrigation/hydraulic infrastructure work projects with the amount of 47,500,000 as Prime contractor, joint venture member, management contractor or Sub-contractor) |        | R                    | NR                      | NR                | R                           | NR                                | NR                      |
| 4.2(b) | for the above and any other contracts completed and under implementation as prime contractor, joint venture member, management contractor or sub-contractor on or after the first day of the calendar year during the period stipulated in 4.2(a) above, a minimum construction experience in the following key activities successfully completed                                                    |        | R                    | NR                      | NR                | R                           | NR                                | NR                      |
| 4.2(c) | Specific Experience in managing ES aspects                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |        | R                    | NR                      | NR                | R                           | NR                                | NR                      |
|        | Demonstrate site specific work schedule, construction methodology and Quality control mechanisms                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |        | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|        | code of conduct for contractor's personnel (ES)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |        | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|        | <b>Contractor Representative and Personnel for the key position</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | No.    |                      |                         |                   |                             |                                   |                         |
|        | Project Manager (BSc/MSc/PhD/4/2/0)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | 1      | R                    |                         | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|        | Construction Engineer (Diploma/BSc/MSc/PhD/5/3/1)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 1      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |



| No. | Evaluation Criteria                                      | Number |                      |                         |                   |                             |                                   |                         |
|-----|----------------------------------------------------------|--------|----------------------|-------------------------|-------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------|
|     |                                                          |        | Wada Engineering PLC | Gudetu Construction PLC | Alet Construction | Girma Assefa Urgessa WWC&BC | Zewudu Lemma General construction | ETWO General contractor |
|     | Construction Forman (Certificate & above/5yrs)           | 3      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | Chief surveyor (BSC.in surveyor)                         | 1      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | Surveyors (Diploma & above in surveying/5yrs )           | 1      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | Environmental and safeguard expert(                      | 1      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | Electro-Mechanical/mechanical Engineer                   | 1      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | <b>Equipment's and Machineries Proposed for the work</b> | No.    |                      |                         |                   |                             |                                   |                         |
|     | Backhoe Loader                                           | 1      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | Chain Excavator (0.6m3 and above)                        | 1      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | Dump truck 7m3 & above                                   | 3      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | Double Cabin 4WD                                         | 1      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | Concrete mixer (200-to-500 litter capacity)              | 3      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | Vibrator for concrete works                              | 3      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | Surveying equipment (Total station)                      | 1      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | Surveying equipment (leveling)                           | 1      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |
|     | shower truck                                             | 1      | R                    | R                       | R                 | R                           | R                                 | R                       |





| No. | Evaluation Criteria     | Number |                      |                         |                   |                             |                                   |                         |
|-----|-------------------------|--------|----------------------|-------------------------|-------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------|
|     |                         |        | Wada Engineering PLC | Gudetu Construction PLC | Alet Construction | Girma Assefa Urgessa WWC&BC | Zewudu Lemma General construction | ETWO General contractor |
|     | OVER ALL RESPONSIVINESS |        | R                    | NR                      | NR                | R                           | NR                                | NR                      |



## Remarks

### **Gudetu Construction PLC**

- The general and specific experience submitted did not meet the requirement because the Gurale Small-Scale Irrigation Project was constructed by another contractor.
- The work volume presented as experience was inconsistent and did not meet the requirement. For example, Madda Walabu University G+3 Office Building and Genamer Water Supply and Sanitation were identified by the committee as non-existing projects.
- The bidder's average annual construction turnover did not meet the specified requirement.

### **Alet Construction**

- The submitted work volume was inconsistent and did not meet the requirement. Examples identified by the committee included construction of Eldar Woreda Water Supply System in Afar Region, Dabos Small-Scale Irrigation Project in Benishangul-Gumuz, and a 10 km asphalt road in Afar Region.
- The bidder's average annual construction turnover did not meet the specified requirement.
- The bidder did not submit evidence of the required cash at hand.

### **Zewudu Lema GC&WC**

It was found non-responsive during the technical evaluation due to failure to meet the minimum general and specific experience requirements stipulated in the Bidding Document. The bidder did not provide sufficient evidence to demonstrate compliance with the required general construction experience and the specific experience relevant to the nature, complexity, and scope of the works under the contract. In particular, the submitted documents did not adequately establish that the bidder had the required experience in successfully executing similar construction projects within the specified period and in accordance with the qualification criteria. Therefore, based on the information and supporting documents submitted, the bidder failed to satisfy the mandatory experience requirements of the Bidding Document and was rejected at the qualification evaluation stage.

### **ETWO General contractor**

- The work volume presented for general and specific experience was inconsistent and did not meet the specified requirement.
- Branch Canal, Taltale Woreda, and Golina Small-Scale Irrigation were identified by the committee as non-existing projects.



- The bidder's average annual construction turnover did not meet the specified requirement.



Accordingly, Wada Engineering PLC and Girma Assefa Urgessa WWC&BC Construction were determined to have met the applicable detailed technical requirements and proceeded to financial evaluation.