

4.3.2. Detail Technical Evaluation

Six (6) bidders, those are being responsive for preliminary evaluation is considered for further technical evaluation.

No.	Evaluation Criteria	ገንዘብ	Bidders Name						
			Kenbon Constr.& Trading	United Construction PLC	Equatorial Construction PLC	Hasen Hawes GC	Feyisa Gutela GC	Zemenay Gashaye GC	Zewdu Lema GC
3	Financial Situation and Performance								
3.1	Financial Capacity								
3.1.1	Access to Financial Source of the bidder (17,000,000 ETB)		R	R	R	R	R	R	R
3.1.2	Audit report for the last 5 years(2020-2024 GC)		R	R	R	R	R	R	NR
3.2	Average Construction turnover								
3.2.1	Average annual construction turnover: Minimum average annual construction turnover of ETB 80 million calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress and/or completed within the last 5 years from (2020 – 2024 G.C) years, divided by 5 years.		R	NR	R	R	NR	R	NR
3.2.2	Average annual turnover: The average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments received for contracts completed within the last 5 years (from 2020 to 2024 G.C) must be 80 million birr Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual turnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax payers branch office.		R	R	R	R	NR	NR	R
4	Experience								



4.1	General experience: Experience under construction contracts in the role of prime contractor, JV member, sub-contractor, or management contractor for at least the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.	R	NR	R	R	R	NR	R	R
4.2	Specific construction and contract Management experience: The bidder must have successfully executed at least one contract in the last five (5) years (2020 to 2024 G.C.) With a minimum amount of 100 million ETB and must be substantially completed or two Contracts each at least 50 million ETB and total 100 million ETB of the two contracts. The Bidder has successfully Participated as prime local contractor in similar irrigation construction works of similar nature and complexity, such as irrigation system, Water supply, Drainage Or similar water related works.	R	NR	R	R	R	NR	R	R
4.3	Cost Break Down (Detailed Breakdown of prices)								
	Labor	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR
	Material	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR
	Equipment	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR
	Price	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR
4.4	General Construction Work methodology:								
a	Site Visit report and verification letter from the district	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR
b	Work schedule	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR	R
i	Material Flow Master Schedule	R	NR	R	R	R	NR	R	R



ii	Human Resources Master Schedule		R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR	R
iii	Cash Flow Master Schedule		R	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
iv	Construction Schedule Methodology		R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
c	Equipment Resources Master Schedule		R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R
5	Code of conduct: Environmental, social, health and safety (ESHS): Code of conduct: Environmental, social (including sexual exploitation and abuse (SEA) and gender-based violence (GBV), health and safety plans should be prepared with Matrix and submitted. This can be written by stating what are the social, health and environmental problems in connection with irrigation scheme construction and what are the possible remedies or protective measures to be undertaken		R	NR	R	R	R	NR	R	R	R
6	Profession	No.									
	1. Project Manager	1	R	NR	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R
	2. Officer Engineer	1	R	NR	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R
	3. Site Engineer	2	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R
	4. Construction Foreman	3	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R
	5. Surveyors	1	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
	6. Environmental, Climate & Safeguard Specialist	1	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR
	7. Social Specialist & Site Organizer	1	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
7	Equipment Proposed for the work	No.									
	1. Dozer	1	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R



(Handwritten signature)

	2.Chain Excavator (0.5m3 and above)	1	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
	3.Dump truck (14m3 & above)	3	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
	4.Double Cabin 4WD(4 person /10 Quintal)	2	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R
	5.Concrete mixer(250-500 litter capacity)	2	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
*	6. Hand compactor	2	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
	7.Vibrator	2	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
	8.Dewatering pump	2	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
	9.Surveying equipment, Total station	1	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
	10.Surveying equipment ,leveling	1	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
	OVER ALL RESPONSIVENESS		R	NR	R	R	R	R	NR	NR	NR	NR

❖ Note: Bidders that fulfill the criteria set will be granted **R** which stands for responsiveness and that does not fit will be given **NR** which stands for Non responsiveness

Among these, only 3(three) bidders are responsive, and considered for financial comparison.



[Handwritten signature]

Reasons of rejection of the 4 bidders are listed as follows:

1. United Construction PLC

- ✦ Since the bidder has not submitted certified Payment received for all construction (only agreement and provisional handover), it is impossible to estimate the bidder's average annual construction turnover
- ✦ There is no site specific matrix of ESMP
- ✦ No submitted Material and Cash flow schedule

2. Feyisa Guteta GC

- ✦ Trade license registration on hard copy and online (e-trade) is different.
- ✦ Bidder is licensed on 2015, but submitted construction experience, which is prior to being licensed, 2013



- ✦ The bidder did not submitted master schedule done by project soft wares.
- ✦ Project Manager proposed by the bidder has no intended experience.



3. Zemenay Gasheye GC

- ✦ Auditor has used Trade license for the 2020, 2021, 2022 and 2023 renewed for the year 2016 only
- ✦ The amount of average annual turnover listed on the letter written from revenue is less than required amount
- ✦ The bidder submitted code of conduct in the name of another contractor (KEFAD on No. 4)
- ✦ professional license is renewed for 2013, not for this year
- ✦ the bidder has only one site engineer instead of 2 required
- ✦ There is only one Forman instead of 3 required
- ✦ The bidder has only two trucks, but 3 trucks are desired

4. Zewdu Lema GC

- ✦ Auditor's Trade license is not renewed for all years
- ✦ Average annual turnover of the bidder does not meet the required amount
- ✦ No Cost Break Down (Detailed Breakdown of labor, equipment cost) in the tender document.
- ✦ Professional license of Environmental, Climate & Safeguard Specialist is given from construction Authority.
- ✦ Taxpayer format for key personnel's has no stamp of revenue administration office.



Handwritten signatures and initials at the bottom of the page.

4.3.3. Financial Comparison

S/N	Bidders Name	Currency	Submitted Readout with Vat	Corrected Arithmetic with Vat	Rank
1	Kenbon Construction & Trading	ETB	180,135,181.39	180,135,226.60	2 nd
2	Equatorial Construction PLC	ETB	126,708,577.08	226,708,703.10	3 rd
3	Hasen Hawes GC	ETB	124,929,217.49	139,630,954.97	1 st

Recommendation for evaluation

Accordingly, Hasen Hawes GC has been recommended as the lowest evaluated bidder for construction of **Hamsiso SSIP** with an amount of ETB **139,630,954.97** (One Hundred Thirty-Nine Million Six Hundred Thirty Thousand Nine Hundred Fifty-Four and 97/100) with 15% VAT.



Handwritten signatures and initials at the bottom of the page.

4.4. Evaluation Result and Discussion of Lot-10 (OgleSSIP)

4.4.1. Preliminary Evaluation

Table 3 Lot-10 (OgleSSIP) Preliminary Evaluation

S/No	Name of the Bidders	Eligibility									Verification						Compl		ES requirem.		Overall Responsiveness	
		Nationality	conflict of interest	Eligibility as per IFAD	Gov' t Owned Entity	United Nation Resolution	History of non-performing contracts	suspension based on execution of bid	Pending litigation	Litigation History	Letter of Bid	VAT Registration Certificate	Valid license	Valid Tax Clearance Certificate	Renewed for 2017 E.C WWC/GWWC	Bid Security	Power of Attorney	Signed & sealed	No. of copy, technical & financial document	Declaration of ES Past Performance		Bank's SEA and /or SH disqualification
1	SYG WWC	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
2	Raba Engineering	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
3	Adugna Ejigu GC	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR	NR	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	R	NR
4	Hilif Construction	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	R	NR
5	United Construction	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
6	Tulema WWC PLC	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
7	Tibeb GWWC JV	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R	R	R	NR

- ❖ *Note: Bidders that fulfil the criteria set will be granted **R** which stands for responsiveness and that does not fit will be given **NR** which stands for Non responsiveness*

From 7(seven) bidders submitted their bid proposals, 3 bidders were failed to be responsive for further detail technical evaluation. The reason for rejection/fail of these bidders is described as follows:



2

7

9

Points of Rejection during Preliminary Evaluation

1. Adugna Ejigu GC

- ✦ Adjudicator on letter of bid is not as per as required
- ✦ The bidder didn't have declaration of ES and Nonperforming history, Pending Litigation, and other formats

2. Hilif Construction

- ✦ Despite of ITB 15.1 which states that "All blank spaces shall be filled in with the information requested", the bidder submitted unfilled letter of bid (#14). The bidder is expected to examine all **instructions, forms, terms, and works requirements** in this bidding document. **Failure to furnish all information** or documentation required by this bidding document may result in the *rejection of the bid* (ITB 9.4)
- ✦ In Bid Data Sheet 47.1, the employer proposed *Addis Ababa Chamber of Commerce* as Adjudicator. But the bidder stated project/work as Adjudicator. Since the name of the potential *adjudicator* proposed by the employer in **ITB BDS 49.1** and by the bidder (letter of bid) shall be subject to *IFAD's no-objection* (ITB 14.4), the bidder required to either accept the proposed adjudicator or set his/her other option instead

3. Tibeb WWC JV Lema Idae

- ✦ Letter of bid--- Security guarantee of Environmental and Social is 1% which is under requirement.
- ✦ Power of Attorney is given for another project (Wachuge SSIP)



[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

4.4.2. Detail Technical Evaluation

Four (4) bidders, those are being responsive for preliminary evaluation is considered for further technical evaluation.

No.	Evaluation Criteria	Unit	Bidders Name			
			Tulena WWC PLC	Raba Engineering PLC	SYG WWC PLC	United Construction PLC
3	Financial Situation and Performance					
3.1	Financial Capacity					
3.1.1	Access to Financial Source of the bidder (5000,000 ETB)		R	R	R	R
3.1.2	Audit report for the last 5 years(2020-2024 GC)		R	R	R	R
3.2	Average Construction turnover					
3.2.1	Average annual construction turnover: Minimum average annual construction turnover of ETB 20 million calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress and/or completed within the last 5 years from (2020 – 2024 G.C) years, divided by 5 years.		NR	R	R	NR
3.2.2	Average annual turnover: The average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments received for contracts completed within the last 5 years (from 2020 to 2024 G.C) must be 80 million birr Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual turnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax payers branch office.		R	R	R	R



4	Experience							
4.1	General experience: Experience under construction contracts in the role of prime contractor, JV member, sub-contractor, or management contractor for at least the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.		R	R	R	R		R
4.2	Specific construction and contract Management experience: The bidder must have successfully executed at least one contract in the last five (5) years (2020 to 2024 G.C.) with a minimum amount of 20 million ETB and must be substantially completed or two Contracts each at least 10 million ETB and total 20 million ETB of the two contracts. The Bidder has successfully Participated as prime local contractor in similar irrigation construction works of similar nature and complexity, such as irrigation system, Water supply, Drainage Or similar water related works.		R	R	R	R		R
4.3	Cost Break Down (Detailed Breakdown of prices)							
	Labor		R	R	R	R		R
	Material		R	R	R	R		R
	Equipment		R	R	R	R		R
	Price		R	R	R	R		R
4.4	General Construction Work methodology:							
a	Site Visit report and verification letter from the district		R	R	R	R		R



b	Work schedule								
i	Material Flow Master Schedule					R	R	R	R
ii	Human Resources Master Schedule					R	R	R	R
iii	Cash Flow Master Schedule					R	R	R	NR
iv	Construction Schedule Methodology					R	R	R	R
e	Equipment Resources Master Schedule					R	R	R	R
5	Code of conduct: Environmental, social, health and safety (ESHS): Code of conduct: Environmental, social (including sexual exploitation and abuse (SEA) and gender-based violence (GBV), health and safety plans should be prepared with Matrix and submitted. This can be written by stating what are the social, health and environmental problems in connection with irrigation scheme construction and what are the possible remedies or protective measures to be undertaken					R	R	R	R
6	Profession	No.							
	1. Project Manager	1				R	R	R	NR
	2. Officer Engineer	1				R	R	R	NR
	3. Site Engineer	1				R	R	R	NR
	4. Construction Foreman	2				R	R	R	R
	5. Surveyors	1				R	R	R	R
	6. Environmental, Climate & Safeguard Specialist	1				R	R	R	R



2

9

7	7. Social Specialist & Site Organizer	1	R	R	R	R	R
	Equipment Proposed for the work	No.					
	1.Chain Excavator (0.5m3 and above)	1	R	R	R	R	R
	2.Dump truck (14m3 & above)	2	R	R	R	R	R
	3.Double Cabin 4WD(4 person /10 Quintal)	2	R	R	R	R	R
	4.Concrete mixer(250-500 liter capacity)	2	R	R	R	R	R
	5. Hand compactor	2	R	R	R	R	R
	6.Vibrator	2	R	R	R	R	R
	7.Dewatering pump	2	R	R	R	R	R
	8.Surveying equipment, Total station	1 set	R	R	R	R	R
	9.Surveying equipment ,leveling	1 set	R	R	R	R	R
	OVER ALL RESPONSIVENESS		NR	R	R	R	NR

➤ Among these, only 2(two) bidders are responsive, and considered for financial comparison.

❖ Note: Bidders that fulfil the criteria set will be granted **R** which stands for responsiveness and that does not fit will be given **NR** which stands for Non responsiveness

Reasons of rejection of the 4 bidders are listed as follows:

1. United Construction PLC

- ✦ Since the bidder has not submitted certified Payment received for all construction (only agreement and provisional handover), it is impossible to estimate the bidder's average annual construction turnover
- ✦ No submitted Material and Cash flow schedule
- ✦ Project Manager, office Engineer and site Engineer agreement date is expired, it is (27/5/2017-30/5/2017 E.C)

2. Tulema WWC

- ✦ Average Annual Construction turnover is below the required amount.



Handwritten signatures and initials in blue ink at the bottom of the page.

4.4.3. Financial Comparison

S/N	Bidders Name	Currency	Submitted Readout with Vat	Corrected Arithmetic with Vat	Rank
1	SYG WWC PLC	ETB	58,723,163.00	58,723,119	1 st
2	Raba Engineering PLC	ETB	72,928,060.64	69,918,485	2 nd

Recommendation for Evaluation

Accordingly, **SYG WWC PLC** has been recommended as the lowest evaluated bidder for the construction of **Ogile SSIP** with an amount of **58,723,119** (Fifty-Eight Million Seven Hundred Twenty-Three Thousand One Hundred Nineteen) with 15%VAT.



2

6

7

8