

4.1.1. Evaluation Result and Discussion of Lot-2 (Dire Hara SSIP)

4.1.1.1. Preliminary Evaluation

Table 1 Lot-2 (Dire Hara SSIP) Preliminary Evaluation

[illegible]

7	Ijoo Construction	R	R	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR
8	Horta GC PLC JV with Belete Megersa WWGC	R	R		R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR
9	Leta Tefera *	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
10	Karemus WWC PLC	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
11	Najaha Ahmed Abdulkarim WWC	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR
12	ABEAM Engineering	R	R	NR	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR
13	Tesfaye Morisa GC	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR

Note: Bidders that fulfil the criteria set will be granted R which stands for responsiveness and that does not fit will be given NR which stands for Non responsiveness

From 13 bidders submitted their bid proposals, 6 bidders were failed to be responsive for further detail technical evaluation. The reason for rejection/fail of these bidders is described as follows



Points of Rejection during Preliminary Evaluation

1. FY Bensa GWWC

- ✚ Even though ITB 23.1, the authorized person or persons signing the bid shall initial all pages of the bid where entries and amendments have been made, the bidder did not sign on bidding document.
- ✚ **Regardless of ITB 15.1, which indicate** "The letter of bid and schedules, including the bills of quantities (or activity schedule) and technical offer information, shall be prepared using the relevant forms furnished in Section IV, **Bidding Forms**. **These forms must be completed without any alterations to its text, and no substitutes shall be accepted. All blank spaces shall be filled in with the information requested**", the bidder did not use letter of bid formatted in bidding forms.
- ✚ And didn't fill forms too.

2. IJOO Construction

- ✚ Bidder stated only 2%performance security which deviates from ITB 47.1 ("In addition to the performance security, the employer also requires the successful bidder to present an environmental and social performance Security. The cumulative value of both performance securities shall not exceed 10 % (8% performance and 2% E&S).
- ✚ The bidder did not describe the specific work/project he/she is going to execute under letter of bid (#3).
- ✚ Letter of bid and declaration of Power of attorney are also not signed
- ✚ The bidder used to submit expired letter of tax clearance

3. Hortu GC PLC JV with Belete Megersa WWGC

- ✚ Joint venture agreement is not verified by 3rd party, or even no witnesses
- ✚ The Bid document is also stamped by single party instead of having the two parties
- ✚ Declared Power of attorney is not signed and also not representative of the two parties (Single Stamped).



4.1.2. Detail Technical Evaluation

Seven (7) bidders, those are being responsive for preliminary evaluation is considered for further technical evaluation.

No.		Evaluation Criteria	Unit	Bidder's Name						
				YE WWC	Boni Construction PLC	KEFAD Const PLC	Wada Engineering JV with Getachew Gudisa GC	Lata Tefera	Nehemia Engineering PLC	Kanenas WWC PLC
3	Financial Situation and Performance									
3.1	Financial Capacity									
3.1.1	Access to Financial Source of the bidder (5,000,000 ETB)			R	R	R	R	R	R	R
3.1.2	Audit report for the last 5 years(2020-2024 GC)			NR	R	R	NR	NR	NR	R
3.2	Average Construction turnover									
3.2.1	Average annual construction turnover: Minimum average annual construction turnover of ETB 20 million calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress and/or completed within the last 5 years from (2020 – 2024 G.C) years, divided by 5 years.			R	R	R	R	R	R	NR



3.2.2	Average annual turnover: The average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments received for contracts completed within the last 5 years (from 2020 to 2024 G.C.) must be 20 million birr. Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual turnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax payers branch office.	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR	NR
4	Experience									
4.1	General experience: Experience under construction contracts in the role of prime contractor, JV member, sub-contractor, or management contractor for at least the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.	NR	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR	R
4.2	Specific construction and contract Management experience: The bidder must have successfully executed at least one contract in the last five (5) years (2020 to 2024 G.C.) with a minimum amount of 20 million ETB and must be substantially completed or two Contracts each at least 10 million ETB and total 20 million ETB of the two contracts.	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR	R



[illegible]

5	Code of conduct: Environmental, social, health and safety (ESHS): Code of conduct: Environmental, social (including sexual exploitation and abuse (SEA) and gender-based violence (GBV)), health and safety plans should be prepared with Matrix and submitted. This can be written by stating what are the social, health and environmental problems in connection with irrigation scheme construction and what are the possible remedies or protective measures to be undertaken	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR
6	Profession 1. Project Manager 2. Officer Engineer 3. Site Engineer 4. Construction Foreman 5. Surveyors 6. Environmental, Climate & Safeguard Specialist 7. Social Specialist & Site Organizer	No.						
		1	NR	R	R	R	R	R
		1	R	R	R	R	R	NR
		1	R	R	R	R	R	R
		2	R	R	R	R	R	R
		1	R	R	R	R	R	R
		1	R	R	R	R	R	R
		1	R	R	R	R	R	R
7	Equipment Proposed for the work 1. Chain Excavator (0.5m3 and above) 2. Dump truck (14m3 & above) 3. Double Cabin 4WD(4 person /10 Quintal)	No.						
		1	NR	R	R	R	R	R
		2	NR	R	R	R	R	R
		2	NR	R	R	R	R	R



4. Concrete mixer (250-500 liter capacity)	2	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
5. Hand compactor	2	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
6. Vibrator	2	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
7. Dewatering pump	2	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR
8. Surveying equipment, Total station	1 set	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
9. Surveying equipment, leveling	1 set	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
OVER ALL RESPONSIVENESS		NR	R	R	R	NR	NR	NR	NR

➤ Among these, only 2(two) bidders are responsive, and considered for financial comparison

❖ **Note:** Bidders that fulfil the criteria set will be granted **R** which stands for responsiveness and that does not fit will be given **NR** which stands for Non responsiveness



Reasons of rejection of the 5 bidders are listed as follows:

1. YE WWC

- ✚ The bidder is licensed 2023, which lead him less experienced than required year, 5 years
- ✚ The bidder submitted only one year audit report while 5 years audit report
- ✚ Agreement of project manager, construction Forman has no agreement year interval
- ✚ The agreement of Equipment Proposed for the work between the contractor and leased part has no contractor's stamp.

2. Wada Engineering JV with Getachew Gudisa GC

- ✚ Audit report for Getachew Gudisa GC is only for 3 years, and is done by unknown auditor
- ✚ Even though master (activity Schedule) should show works/ activities and time needed to complete, the bidder submitted Construction schedule which has no work description
- ✚ According **Section -3 Bid Examination, Evaluation** must meet criteria set on 5.5, general work methodologies will not be valid unless specific to the site. But the bidder submitted methodology which is not site specific.
- ✚ And also must meet criteria under 5.5 (a) require Site Visit report and verification letter from the district. The bidder submitted site visit letter approved by zone, and has no report.

3. Leta Tefera GWWC

- ✚ The bidder's financial situation is audited by auditor who was licensed 2013/2021, but the auditor used to audit starting from 2020, which is prior to his licensing year.
- ✚ Auditor is required to be authorized and authenticated auditor, but the bidder used authorized accountant.



የተመዘገበበት ቁጥር
 ORO/Nt/C2/1/0002142/2013
 የገብር ክፍል መለያ ቁጥር
 0011450173
 የድርጅት / የገለሰብ ስም
 አሸም ተኔ ሳ.ዲ
 የድርጅት / የገለሰብ ስም በአጋጣሚ
 ASHIM TUNE SADO
 ህጋዊ አድራሻ
 ገለሰብ ነጋዴ
 ካፒታል
 16229
 የተመዘገበበት ቀን
 3/10/2013

ስራ አስኪያጅ



አሸም ተኔ
 ASHIM TUNE

- ✚ No Material Flow Master Schedule, Equipment Resources Master Schedule
- ✚ The agreement date between the office Engineer and the contractor was signed on 15/02/2017 but the agreement is signed for 15/02/2015-15/02/2017 E.C
- ✚ Site visit letter does not state the contractor or representative

4. Nehemia Engineering PLC

- ✚ The bidder is licensed on 2014 E.C/2021 GC, but the bidder submitted project construction experience from 2020 GC and specific experience, General experience and average annual turnover not meet the requirement, which is not logical
- ✚ There is no construction and equipment schedule
- ✚ Code of conduct is not stated as per as required
- ✚ Project Manager has no professional license



10:39 AM

የቤተሰብ አስተዳደር ደ/ር



አዲስ አበባ

ጥቅምት

የንግድ ምዝገባ

የተመዘገበበት ቁጥር

AK/AA/2/0013545/2014

የገብር ክፋይ መለያ ቁጥር

0075184647

የድርጅት / የግለሰብ ስም

የህግ ሥልጣን አገልግሎት ሚኒስቴር የተወሰነ የግል
ማህበር

የድርጅት / የግለሰብ ስም በእንግሊዝኛ

NEHEMIA ENGINEERING PLC

ህጋዊ አድራሻ

ካፒታል

1000000

የተመዘገበበት ቀን

26/1/2014

ስራ አስኪያጅ



የሥራ አስኪያጅ ስም

5. Kanenus WWC PLC

- ✦ The bidder has no intended Construction turnover amount
- ✦ There is no letter of evidence from Ministry of Revenue for construction annual average turnover
- ✦ Code of conduct is not well stated
- ✦ Experience given for Project manager is overlapped and also Letter of experience written has no reference number.
- ✦ The bidder proposed office engineer having only graduate professional license while the document acquire about 6 years work experience
- ✦ The bidder submitted only one dewatering pump instead of two.



4.1.3. Financial Comparison

S/N	Bidders Name	Currency	Submitted Readout with Vat	Corrected Arithmetic with VAT	Rank
1	KEFAD Construction PLC	ETB	53,980,397.30	68,944,944.79	2 nd
2	Boni Construction PLC	ETB	29,958,157.70	26,998,362.83	1 st

Recommendation for Evaluation

Accordingly, **Boni Construction PLC** has been recommended as the lowest evaluated bidder for the construction of **Dire Hara SSIP** with an amount of **26,998,362.83** (Twenty-Six Million Nine Hundred Ninety-Eight Thousand Three Hundred Sixty-Two and 83/100) with 15% VAT.



Handwritten signature or mark.

Handwritten signature or mark.

Handwritten signature or mark.

Handwritten signature or mark.

4.2. Evaluation Result and Discussion of Lot-3 (ImiruSSIP)

4.2.1. Preliminary Evaluation

Table 3 Lot-3 (Imiru SSIP) Preliminary Evaluation

SN	Name of the Bidders	Eligibility									Verification							Completen		ES requirement.		Overall	
		Nationality	conflict of interest	Eligibility as per IFAD	Gov' t Owned Entity	United Nation Resolution	History of non-performing contracts	suspension based on	Pending litigation	Litigation History	Letter of Bid	VAT Registration	Valid license	Valid Tax Clearance	Renewed for 2017 E.C WWC/GWC	Bid Security	Power of Attorney	Signed & sealed	No. of copy, technical&	Declaration of ES	Past Performance		Bank's SEA and /or SH disqualification
1	Niguse Kidane WWC	R	NR	NR	NR	NR	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR
2	MET Metal Engineering Work PLC	R	NR	NR	R	NR	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR
3	Kenbon Construction and Trading	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
4	Daniel Tamere	R	NR	NR	R	NR	R	R	R	R	NR	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	NR	NR



[illegible]

2

6



