3. Lot-1 (Oda Muda SSIP) Evaluation and Qualification Criteria

3. 1. Preliminary Evaluation and Qualification Criteria

Table 2: Preliminary evaluation result

ssau	Sviensquay HaravO	NR	N.	N.	NR	06	ž	×	œ
tal'	HS 50/ ben ABS c'sland nothestiffenpeib	NR	ž	ać.	N.	24	æ	×	25
Environmental Social requirements	Declaration: environmental and social(ES) Pase Performance	æ	2	æ	æ	né né	ĸ	ĸ	×
Completeness of Bid	No. of copy, technical & financial document	æ	od.	×	æ	oć.	œ	×	œ
Com	baleas & bangi2	ad	NR	×	od	24	24	ps	as.
	to rewort to morning and yourself.	oc.	*	n¢	nci	æ	06	pc	201
	Динээд рід	os.	pt.	œ	pc	2	æ	DE.	×
	Renewed for 2017 B.C. Grade 5 & above	×	od	8	#	pd	æ	~	ec.
Verification	Valid Tax Cleanance Certificate	06	ai ai	95	ac.	24	nd.	ec	nd
Veri	Valid Trade heense or Business organization Registration Certificate	8	ad	Я	≅	æ	Dd.	~	oć.
	nodesigaM TAV Centralicate	ek	×	æ	od	ac	æ	æ	od.
	Letter of Bid	× ×	ž	×	N Z	es.	NE.	æ	œ
	YrotziH moitagitid.	es	od.	×	N.	86	æ	œ	ni
	Pending Jitiganion	24	×	06	× ×	26	96	æ	2
	Suspension based on execution of bid securing declaration by Employer on bid and Io Manhdraw	NR	NR	×	æ	24	×	×	×
lity	History of non-preforming	oć	nd)	æ	ž	nd	er.	es	ns
Eligibility	United Nation Resolution	oc	nd .	æ	NR	24	×	ot	ad
	Covernment Owned Entity	DE.	×	×	ž	pc	×	06	ρű
	Eligibility as per IFAD	ž	N.	oc	×	25	oc	×	M
	teeratri To taifinoa	DK.	p¢.	24	- o6	æ	24	or.	pc.
•	VillanoitaM	æ	æ	as.	×	ad	ad	2	œ
	Name of the Contractors	Sylpas Solomon GC & WWC	FT Bonsa GWWC	Minyabil Tefera GC	Tilahun Kifile GC	Equatorial Construction ple	Cosmos Engineering & Comerce plc	Gashaw Benti WWC&BC	Barkot Construction
	2 /38	335	201	1	**	90	· e	65	ien

6 Page

ismo	Overall Respi	N.	1	N.	×	0.5	XX.	¤	×	B	1	×	0	Z																	
HS	Hemk's SEA and too S disqualification	8		ž.	2	1	ok!	pc.	æ	2		×	D	ds for																	
	ted social(ES) Past	=		NR	8		pd.	R	pć.	p	4	p¢.	N	R R R R R R R R R R R R R R R R R R R																	
20	No. of copy, reclanical financial document	0		200		4	ni	200	0		H.	24		R WR																	
-	palmas & bangis		×	ad	0	*	œ	22	0	4	H.	×	_	× 2																	
j	Declaration of Power o Amonta		oc.	200		oc.	06	0	4 6	×	×	×	_	os.																	
-	Big Security	T	06	2	1	×	2	0	6 1	×	×	×	L	= 1																	
1	Renewed for 2017 E.C. Grade 5 & above		œ	24		Ж	×		×	pi.	N	od	L	×																	
1	Certificate		DÉ	00		ot	p		nt.	96	at	a		ec																	
-	Positives organization Certificate		×	06		ek.		2	eć.	×	a	0	4	æ																	
t	VAT Registration Certificate		84		4	24	,	4	pć	×	0	4 5	¥	pć																	
1	Lotter of Bid		ž	22		25	1	ž.	×	×	0	× 1	×	nd.																	
	Linigation History		ž	9	2	H		ž	×	02		×	×	×																	
	Pending Miligation		æ		×	=		×	×	ä		M.	04	ο¢																	
	cation of hid securing anation by Employer or	axe lash	24		pc		×	ы	92		4	200	×	26																	
	counsels		pć		×	1	×	ps	9		ni.	20	n¢	æ																	
versment Owrsed Entity  Eg		TEAD THE DESTREE T		and Marion Resolution		A SHA	NR		al		os	øs	0	· D	oc.	æ	×	×													
				Eligib	100000000				versument Owned Entity		erriment Owned Entity		stranent Owned Entity		viring barreO frammen		viring barned finitiy	timent Owned Entity		pc		×		oć.	od		×	06	as	ø	at
				Medialy as per IFAD			1		×		04	pú	1	×	×	×	QK.	丝													
						_	a		06		nd	nć.		M.	×	œ	a	1													
	gillenoiteM		22	4	#		×		+	Œ.	at	04	gu.	-																	
	Name of the Contractors		Titlin acce	Germa Tafesser CA.2k. W.W.C.	Admass	os Admasu	Netrniva Engineering ple				Carlo de Carlo	Pavining Occa ii ii	Wada tingineering	Cemenay Castarye Co. Tadaye Benti WWC JV with																	
_	ž	_	+	6		9/	1	100	67	ings to dis	4		1	10																	
	Hi min	Nationably  Author of interest  Confirm to the per IFAD  The of interest of in	Nationable Conflict of interes Conflict of interes Conflict of interes Conflict of interes Coverament Owned Entity Coverament Owned Entity Coverament Owned Entity Conflict of Nation Resolution Conflict of National Orleans Attorney or Conflictate	Nationable  Countries of interest  Charles of interest  Countries  Countri	Contraction of the countries of the Countries of the Countries of the Countries of Interest Countries of Countri	Contractors of the body of the body of the body of the body of more and the body of the body of more and the body of the	Cemerate Admission of the countraction of the Construction of Construction	Admission Admission  Networks Englished Nations Constitution  Networks Englished Nations (1984)  Networks Of non-preferming before or interest and the countries of the countrie	Agentunia Fuginecuring pic and socialities and socialities of the Construction of the Construction of the Construction of the Construction of the Securing S	Nemarket Englineering Pick  Nemarket Englineering  Nem	Charletter Admission of the bid bid for the bid bid for the bid bid for the bid bid for the bid bid bid for the bid bid bid for the bid	Circus Admission No. 20. No. 2	Griman Ariaw Building road & wax wax with features Admissi and the confidence of the Configuration of the configur	Common of the Contractors with Telesco CGC w www. Activities Admission in the Contractors with Telesco CGC w www. Activities Admission is a many of mon-precision in the Contractors of mon-precision in the Contr																	

Note: Bidders that fulfil the criteria set granted "R" which

responsiveness

### 3.2. Remark on Preliminary Evaluation

Based on the preliminary evaluation result the following eight (8) bidders could not succeed to the technical evaluation and became Non-responsive bids as well as are rejected at this stage due to the reasons below

### 1-Yonas Solomon GC & WWC

- Letter of bid misrepresentation: Bid the performance security in Letter of Bid Serial #7 altered, substituted, and not appropriately fulfilled, in accordance with ITB 47.1.
- Letter of distortion: On Letter of Bid #10, # 11 and #19 not incorporated, substituted and altered which contradicts as per ITB 15.1 and 49.1.

### 2-FY Bonsa GWWC-1

- Letter of distortion: The letter of bid altered, substituted, and modified, which contradicts as per ITB 15.1 and 49.1.
- The provided bidder document not signed on all pages.

### 3-Tilahun Kifle GC

- Letter of Bid not fulfilled with necessary information and became blank and no response to the requirements for instant Performance security ES and Potential Adjudicator, which contradict as per ITB 15.1 and ITB 49.1 respectively.
- Not Submitted Government Owned Entity and United Nations Resolution by using required Bidding Forms ELI 1.1 & ELI 1.2 with attachment.
- Not Submitted History of non-performing contract, Litigation History and Pending Litigation and by using required Bidding Forms CON-2.

### 4-Girma Tafesse GC & WWC

- Letter of Bid altered, substituted and modified which contradict as per ITB 15.1 and 49.1.
- Not Submitted Government Owned Entity and United Nations Resolution by using required Bidding Forms ELI 1.1 & ELI 1.2 with attachment
- Not Submitted History of non-performing contract, Litigation History and Pending Litigation and by using required Bidding Forms CON-2.

### 5-Gemechu Admasu JV with Tedros Admasu

- Letter of Bid altered, substituted and modified which contradict as per ITB 15.1 and 49.1.
- Declaration: environmental and social (ES) Past Performance not submitted.

### 6-Girma Asfawu Road & WWC JV Jarso WWC & GC

- Letter of Bid #7 (performance security for Environmental and Social Security not fulfilled correctly with necessary information).
- The agreement for the Joint Venture was not made to the specific project location and did not comply with the original intent of the partnership."

Not Submitted Litigation History by using required Bidding Forms CON-2.

# 7-Minyahil Tefera GC

 Letter of Bid not fulfilled with necessary information and became blank and no response to the requirements for instant Performance security ES and Potential Adjudicator, which contradict as per ITB 15.1 and ITB 49.1 respectively.

# 8- Cosmos Engineering & Commerce PLC

- Letter of Bid not fulfilled with necessary information and became blank and no response to the requirements for instant Performance security ES
- Letter of Bid #7 (performance security for Environmental and Social Security not fulfilled correctly with necessary information).
- The Letter of Bid was missing key information, including the proposed Adjudicator, as required under as per ITB BDS 49.1.

NB: The aforementioned seven(7) bidders were deemed non-responsive and excluded from the technical evaluation phase due to material deficiencies, unauthorized alterations of the bid template, omission of critical documents, and failure to comply with eligibility, legal and ES requirements as stipulated in the bidding documents.

The following ten (10) bidders found to have met all preliminary requirements and therefore advanced to the Technical Evaluation stage:

- 1. Gashaw Benti WWC & BC
- 2. Barkot Construction GC & WWC-1 GC & WWC-1
- 3. Nehmiya Engineering PLC
- 4. Wada Engineering
- 5. Zemenay Gashiye GC
- 6. Pavilion GC & WWC
- 7. Equatorial Construction PLC
- 8. Tadase Benti WWC JV with DAD Construction & Trading
- 9. Yishak Abebe GC

These firms further evaluated based on the Qualification and Evaluation Criteria outlined under Section III of the Bidding Document, focusing on experience, personnel, equipment, and methodology among others.

For fry me

3.3, Technical Evaluation and Qualification Criteria

Table 3: Lot-1 (Oda Muda) Technical Evaluation results

No.	Evaluation Criteria	YadmuN	Gashaw Benii WWC&BC	Barkoi Construction	Nebulya Engineering PLC	Wads Engineering	Zemenay Gashiye GC	Pavilion GC & WWC	Equatorial Censtruction PLC	Tadase Banti JV WWC with DAD Construction and Trading PLC	Yishak Abebe GC
- 22	Financial Situation and Performance										
21.1	Access to Cash flow of the hidder (15.000.000 ETB)		pd.	at .	æ	×	×	×	ař	st.	×
212	Audit report for the last 5 years(2020-2024 GC)		nt	at .	NR	22	N.S.	NR	ec.	×	×
22	Average amusi construction turnover: Minimum average immal construction turnover of ETER 75 million calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress and/or completed within the last 5 years. from (2020 – 2024 G.C.) years, divided by 5 years.		я	×	NR	oć.	ĸ	zd.	×	×	×
Scotumiting Nas	Average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments. The average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments received for continues completed within the last 5 years (from 2020 to 2026 GC) must be 95 million ber.  Sidden must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Armual turnover. Interested by the required Ministry of Keretue tos payers branch office.		æ	ë	ž	æ	Ä	ec.	86	æ	ž
m	Experience										
37	General experience Experience under construction contracts in the rule of prime contractor, IV member, sub-contractor, or management contractor for at least the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.		oć	æ	ž	н	as:	æ	ш	×	W
2	Specific construction and dontract Management experience: The bisdort must have processfully executed at least one contract in the last five (5) years (2020 to 2024 G.C.) with a minimum amount of 100 million ETB and must be substantially completed or two Contracts each at least 50 million ETB and with 100 million ETB and outside as prince boal contracter in million ETB and substantially extracted as prince boal contracter in emillion trapation constructed works of similar nature and complexity, such as impathen system, Water supply, Deninage Or similar water related works.		DE.	*	2	ĸ	œ	=	ed	DE .	.04

No.		13					- week		201010000000000000000000000000000000000	IN WWC with	j
T	Evaluation Criteria	Numb	Gashaw Benif WWC&BC	Barkot Construction	Nehmiya Engineering PLC	Wada Engineering	Zenenay Gashiye GC	Pavilion GC& WWC	Equatorial Canstruction PLC	DAD Construction and Trading PLC	Yishak Abebe GC
-	Cost Break Down (Detailed Breakdown of prices)  (E) Breakdown of the boric prices for labour (converted time currency indicated in SCC)  (E) Breakdown of hastic supply prices for materials and costsumables (converted time currency indicated in SCC)  (E) Breakdown of basic houtly prices for equipment (converted time currency subjected in SCC)  (E) Breakdown of tail prices in the price schedule (converted into currency subjected in SCC)  (E) Breakdown of tail prices in the price schedule (converted into currency subjected in SCC)  (E) Breakdown of Sine Coots (converted into currency indicated in SCC)		âd	*	æ	æ	#4	tal	od.	×	
	General Construction Work methodology:										4
	a, Site Visit report and verification letter from the district		×	R	ad	æ		ed.	M.		+
	b. Work schedule								2	2007	+
	Material Flow Master Schedule		NE	æ	×	K K	N.	N.R.		N.	+
4	Human Resources Master Schedule		NS	œ	26	×	N	NR	86	ž	-
jajan	Cash Flow Master Schedule	L	ž	æ	×	NR	N.	EK.	×	H.	-
TOTAL .	Construction schoolule methodology		×	ac	×	R	nc.	8	ď	pć	-
1	C. Equipment Resources Master Schodule		NR	ж	×	N.	ž	XX.	nd .	ž	-
	Code of conduct: Environmental, social, health and safety (ESHS): Code of coodoct: Environmental, social (including sextral exploitation and abuse (SEA) and gender-based violence (CBV), health and safety plans should be propured with Main's and substructed. This can be written by straing what are the social, health and environmental problems in connection with intigation scheme construction and what are the possible remedies or protective measures to be undertaken.		ž	×	×	ec.	ž	2	æ	NR	

										Tadase Banti	
ź	Evaluation Criteria	33dma/s.	Gashaw Benti wwc&BC	Barkot Construction	Nehmiya Engineering PLC	Wada Engineering	Zemenay Gashiye GC	Pavilion GC & WWC	Equatorial Construction PLC	Jy WWC with DAD Construction and Trading PLC	-2
		No									
P1-	Profession Qualification	-	p	22	æ	pr	86	ox	×	ac.	_
	1.Project Managiff	-		9	a	as	×	×	æ	×	- 1
	2. Officer Engineer	-	×				0	ox	п	26	
	1 Cos Frances	-	В	æ	as.	×	4			200	
	Color and Color	e	В	N.	R.	æ	ek.	×			
	4.Construction Forman		4		a	00	R	-	nd	×	
	5. Surveyors		×		5 6	p	n	NR	ni	NR	
	6. Environmental, Climate & Safeguard Specialist	1	NR	9	4		100	97		N.	
	7 Social Seccialist & Size Degation	-	NR	1	a	NK	NR	400			
1	the state of the s	No									
is.	Equipment Proposed are assessed.			٥	24	25	26	×	at	N.	- 1
	1.Chain Exavaior (0.5m3 and above)		-			0	H	ac	R	86	
1	2.Damp truck (14m3 & above)		œ.	8	K 1		9	8	2	DK.	
	3. Double Cabin 4WD(4 person /10 Quintal)	-	×	×	ai .	4 1			00	=	
ŧ,	A Consequence and send 250-500 littler connectity)	F-8	nc	at.	06	×	4			9	
4	A A CONTROL OF THE PARTY OF THE	-	8	06	×	×	×	H	×	6	- 1
-	Hand compactor	1		0	22	×	×	œ	es.		-
70	V Newstor	4			D	ox.	22	×	×	st	
100	Dewsering juing		2 R	×	4			0	0	04	
1	8 Surveying oquipment, Total station		ns - 1	×	æ	2	×	4	4		
1	o Commission assistances feeding		= 1	1K	at	×	Ж	ac ac	×		- 1
1	Stationary apparent to remain		an an	×	NR	NR	NR	NR	œ	NR	
	OVER ALL RESPONSIVINESS		uni.	-			100	will be de	motod as W	NR" which	- AP

Non-responsiveness

### 3.4. Remarks on Technical Evaluation

Following successful completion of the preliminary evaluation, bidders who met the basic eligibility and administrative requirements advanced to the technical evaluation stage. This stage carried out in accordance with the criteria outlined in Section III: Evaluation and Qualification Requirements of the Bidding Document. The purpose of the technical evaluation is to assess the bidders' qualifications, personnel, experience, and proposed methodology to determine their capacity to execute the works effectively and in compliance with the required standards.

Upon review, seven (7) bidders wound to be non-responsive at the technical stage due to major shortcomings in experience documentation, staffing, compliance with project-specific planning, and failure to adhere to key environmental and social safeguards. Below is a detailed justification for each:

# 1. Gashaw Benti WWC & BC

- Professional Licensing: The Social Specialist and Site Organizer lacked valid professional licenses. Additionally, the agreements between these experts and the company were neither signed nor time-bound, undermining the credibility of personnel commitment.
- CV Authorization: CVs for all key experts, including the Project Manager, were neither signed by the experts themselves nor endorsed by the company's authorized representative, violating bid form requirements.
- Qualification Mismatch: The Environmental, Climate, and Safeguard Specialist's academic background and professional credentials did not align with the required qualifications outlined in the bid document.
- Code of Conduct: The submitted Code of Conduct failed to include provisions on the prevention of Sexual Exploitation and Abuse (SEA) and Gender-Based Violence (GBV), which are essential under the World Bank's Environmental and Social Framework (ESF).
- Work Planning: The bidder did not submit the Material, Human Resource, Equipment, and Cash Flow Master Schedule via the required project management software, nor was a resource allocation sheet included.

# 2. Zemenay Gashaye GC

- Invalid Financial Audit: The private auditor's trade license was issued in 2023 (2016 EC), making the audit results for the period 2020–2024 legally invalid and unacceptable.
- > Turnover Requirement: The average annual construction turnover, as stated in a confirmation letter from the Tax Office, failed to meet the minimum threshold required by the bidding document.

- Master Schedules Missing: No submission of Material, Equipment, Human Resource, or Cash Flow schedules through the designated project software; resource allocation sheet also missing.
- Code of Conduct: The Code of Conduct was not prepared under the bidder's official name, but rather under another company's name—raising concerns of authenticity.
- Professional Licensing: The Social Specialist and Site Organizer were not licensed professionals.
- CV Format Non-Compliance: CVs were not completed using the designated bidding forms and lacked necessary authorization by the company's representative.

### 3. Pavilion GC & WWC

- Unacceptable Audit Report: The audit report was conducted by a private auditor whose license had not been renewed, rendering the report invalid for evaluation purposes.
- Missing ESHS Code of Conduct: The bidder did not submit a Code of Conduct addressing Environmental, Social, Health, and Safety (ESHS) standards.
- Incomplete Work Planning: Required master schedules for resources were not prepared or submitted through the specified project software.
- Unqualified Personnel: Neither the Environmental and Social Specialist nor the Social Specialist and Site Organizer held the necessary professional licenses.

# 4. Wada Engineering PLC

- Work Planning Deficiency: Material, Equipment, Cash Flow, and Human Resource schedules were not submitted through the designated project software.
- Personnel Qualifications: The Social Specialist and Site Organizer lacked the required academic and professional credentials.
- Incomplete Personnel Agreement: The required Code of Conduct agreements between the bidder and all key experts were missing; only the Environmental and Social Specialist was covered.

### 5. Tadase Benti WWC JV with DAD Construction & Trading

- Master Schedules Not Submitted: Material, Equipment, and Human Resource schedules were not prepared in project software format and were entirely missing.
- Missing Code of Conduct Agreements: No evidence of executed agreements between the bidder and the proposed experts using the official bidding forms.
- Unqualified Experts: The Environmental and Social Specialist, as well as the Social Specialist and Site Organizer, lacked the necessary academic qualifications and valid licenses to fulfill their roles.

14 Page

# 6. Yishak Abebe GC

- Financial Ineligibility: Both the average annual construction tumover and the overall annual turnover were below the minimum thresholds required.
- Work Planning Deficiency: No master schedules were prepared or submitted through project software.
- Unqualified Personnel: The Environmental and Social Specialist's qualifications did not align with the required standards; additionally, the Social Specialist and Site Organizer lacked professional licenses.

# 7. Nehmiya Engineering PLC

- Lack of Experience: The bidder submitted both general and specific construction experiences dated before the company's establishment, thereby not fulfilling the requirement.
- Unsubstantiated Financial Turnover: The turnover evidence provided by the bidder's supporting letter based on non-existent experience, lacking credibility.
- Invalid Audit Report: The audit report referenced the years 2012-2013 EC, which predated the formation of the company, making it invalid.

After comprehensive review, the evaluation team concluded that **only three (3) bidders** fully satisfied the technical evaluation requirements and considered responsive for progression to the financial evaluation stage. These bidders are:

- 1. Barkot Construction GC & WWC-1
- 2. Equatorial Construction PLC

These firms demonstrated acceptable financial soundness, qualified personnel, valid licensing, and comprehensive project planning in accordance with the bidding document requirements.

15mg

gu.

2

15 | Page



K

### 3.5. Financial Evaluation

# Table 4: Lot-1(Oda Muda) Financial evaluation results

Following the completion of the financial evaluation in accordance with the World Bank procurement guidelines and the PACT project's procurement procedures, the recommended least evaluated bidder is identified as follows:

	4-204		Re	ad out price		1266	adjusted after imetic check	
No	Name of the Contractors	With Out VAT	After Rabbet (%)	With VAT (15%)	With Out VAT	After Rabbet (%)	With VAT (15%)	Rank
1	Barkot Construction	221,058,912.92		254,257,795.86	220,863,881.44		253,993,463.66	$1_{\rm H}$
2	Equatorial Construction PLC	222,826,407	3%	248,562,857.23	234,277,441.27	3%	261,336,485.74	2 <sup>nd</sup>

The recommended bidder submitted a substantially responsive bid in the technical evaluation and passed all qualification requirements.

The evaluated bid price is determined after applying all necessary adjustments in accordance with the bidding documents.

ting 9

m



# 3.6. Recommendation of the Evaluation

Accordingly, Barkot Construction GC & WWC-1 is the first least evaluated bidder and has been recommended for award with the evaluated bid price amount of 253,993,463.66 (Two hundred fifty-three million nine hundred ninety-three thousand four hundred sixty-three birr and sixty-six cents.) inclusive of VAT.

# 4. Lot-4(Rorisa) Evaluation and qualification criteria

4.1 Preliminary evaluation and qualification criteria

Table 5: Preliminary evaluation result

	2 8 3 3	the grant	Tima's	Sofaniya	-	Walific 5 GC-3	6 Adagma	Odb C with Bo
	Name of the Contractors	Shorth Engineering OWWC-1 IV welly Dubefo Tenesho WWC-1	Tinsa's Ashok Kumur WWGC-1	Sofaniyas Geta Abebe WWGC-3	Yaboon Construction & Engineering WWC-1	Wallf Construction State Company GC-3	Adagmı Üğu Hordofa GC-3	Odla Construction PLC GC-5 JV with Bonny Degebass GWWC-1
	ynineoist/	oc	×	м	œ	×	nt	œ
	senaturi 3o taillinea	æ	nd.	ad	cat	pd.	ac	ø
	CAH rog as vitiliting its	pt	ad	ž	œ	×	06	ex
	Government Owned Entity	26	×	nd.	25	pć.	×	
Eligh	United Mation Resolution	æ	×	D4	ж	×	ot	ø
billey	Contracts Elstory of non-preforming	×	ď	×	82	×	æ	×
	suspension based on execution of bid securing declaration by Employer or withdrawal of the bid within bid ralidity	æ	at	Ř	В	N.	R	×
	noinsgirif gnibeaq	pl	ai	ad	æ	ei	æ	æ
	grossili nonsgiri.1	nd	od.	×	×	ac	×	×
	bill To tatte.J	pd	×	ž	26	NR	æ	æ
	VAT Registration Certificate	×	æ	ac	×	×	×	pri
Ver	Valid Trade focuse to Business organization Registration	≃	ns.	pt.	×	×	×	pc
Verification	Valid Tax Clearance Certificate	oć.	pt.	æ	×	at	æ	ex.
	Remayade for 2017 E.C WWC or GWWC or GC Grade 5 &	œ	D.C	ne.	36	×	×	DC
	Bid Security	es.	nt	=	*	25	ns.	σć
	Declaration of Power of Attorney	od	nc nc	nd.	zć	×	æ	×
Completeness of Bid	bolsos & bangič	æ	DŽ	TE.	×	2	æ	
teness	No. of copy, technical & financial document	æ	×	æ	×	æ	86	æ
Enviro Se requir	Declaration: environmental and social(E5) Pass Performance	ps.	œ	Œ	×	æ	×	×
Social requirements	HS to/ bas AHS sylind molitorillangesib	ø	×	N N	26	N.	æ	œ
	Overall Responsiveness	œ	×	N.	×	N	×	2

Note: Bidders that fulfil the criteria set granted "R" which stands for responsiveness and that does not fit denoted by "NR" which stands for Non-

responsiveness

### 4.2. Remark on Preliminary evaluation

The preliminary evaluation carried out to assess the administrative compliance and responsiveness of bids based on the requirements stated in the Instructions to Bidders (ITB) and Section IV: Bidding Forms of the IFAD procurement document. Bids that failed to comply with these essential submission requirements considered non-responsive and disqualified from proceeding to the technical evaluation stage.

# 1-Sofaniyas Getu Abebe WWGC-3

- No Letter of Bid submitted according to IFAD tender document Section IV Bidding form and it altered, substituted and fulfilled with unnecessary information.
- Not Submitted on Letter of Bid Bank's SEA and/or SH disqualification.

# 2-Walif Construction Share Company GC-3

- Letter of Bid altered, substituted and modified which contradict as per ITB 15.1 and 49.1.
- Specifically the Letter of Bid #12, which addresses the disclosure of commissions, gratuities, or fees, completed with inappropriate or unnecessary information. The section intended to be marked "None" unless such payments actually made. Including irrelevant details not only violates the intended purpose of the clause but may also raise concerns of transparency and ethical compliance. Due to these inconsistencies and breaches of the bidding document provisions, the bid declared non-responsive and excluded from further evaluation.

The following **five (5) bidders** found to have met all preliminary requirements and therefore advanced to the Technical Evaluation stage:

for pay

X

Table 6: Lot-4(Rorisa) Technical Evaluation results 43. Technical Evaluation and qualification criteria

No.  Evaluation Criteria  No.  Evaluation Criteria  No.  Evaluation Criteria  No.  Evaluation Criteria  Shodeb Engineering  Deden Tenesho  WWCC-1  Adugna  Shode Show of the bidder (6,000,000 ETB)  NR  RR  RR  RR  RR  RR  RR  RR  RR  R	2		ľ		8	Bidder's Name		
Financial Situation and Performance  Access to Cash flow of the bidder (6,040,000 ETB)  Audit report for the last 3 years(20.2024 GC)  Average annual construction turnover.  Minimum average annual construction turnover of ETB 30 million  Average annual construction turnover.  Average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments  Average annual turnover alculated as total certified	ģ	Evaluation Criteria		hodeb Engineering GWWC-1 JV with Dedefo Tenesho WWC-1	Tinsa'e Ashok Kumar WWGC-1	Adugna Ljigu Hordofa GC-3	Yabeon Construction & Engineering WWC-1	Construction PLC GC-5 JV with Bonny Degebass GWWC-3
Average annual construction turnover:  Average annual turnover:  Average annual turnover eleulated by 5 years.  Average annual turnover calculated by 5 years (from 2020 and 2020	-	Financial Situation and Performance						1
Average annual construction turnover:  Average annual construction turnover of ETB 30 million  Average annual construction turnover:  Minimum average annual construction turnover of ETB 30 million  calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in  groupers and/or completed within the last 5 years from (2020 – 2024)  Average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments  received for contracts completed within the last 5 years (from 2020)  Received for contracts completed within the last 5 years (from 2020)  Redders must present a letter of cridence and notifications of Annual unravver teletristated by the required Ministry of Revenue tax  payers branch office.  Experience  General experience:  Experience  Contractors of meaning 1st January 2020.  Redesign and a series of contractors of meaning stream of contractors for at least the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.	1	Access to Cash flow of the bidder ( 6,000,000 ETB)			R	25	×	×
Average annual construction turnover:  Minimum average armual construction turnover of ETTB 30 million  Minimum average armual construction turnover of ETTB 30 million  acalculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress and/or completed within the last 5 years from 2020 – 2024  G.C. years, divided by 5 years.  Average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments  The average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments  tescived for entimote completed within the last 5 years (from 2020 and 2024 g.C.) must be 30 million bird.  Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual turnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax  payers branch office.  Experience  Conoral experience:  Experience  Conoral experience  Experience  Conoral experience  Experience  Conoral experience  Experience  Conoral experience  Experience under construction contractor, or management contractor  for at least the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.	2 5	Audit report for the last 3 years(2020-2024 GC)		NR	æ	N	Ж	2
Average annual turnover:  The average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments  The average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments  The average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments  The average annual turnover calculated within the last 5 years (from 2020  Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual turnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax  Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual turnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax  Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual turnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax  Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual turnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax  Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual turnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax  Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual turnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax  Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual turnover letter issued by the required within the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.  Recent at the last the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.	FN.	Average annual construction turnover:  Minimum average unital construction turnover of ETB 30 million calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress and/or completed within the last 5 years from (2020 – 2024 G.C.) years, divided by 5 years.		N.	æ	N	æ	æ
Experience:  General experience:  Experience under construction contracts in the role of prime  Experience under construction contractor, or management contractor  contractor, JV member, sub-contractor, or management contractor  for at least the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.	March Marines	Average annual turnover:  The average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments received for contracts completed within the last 5 years (from 2020 to 2024 G.C.) must be 30 million birr.  Bidders must present a letter of evidence and notifications of Annual numover. Letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax payers branch office.		×	64	X X	×	at .
General experience: Experience under construction contracts in the role of prime  Experience under construction, or management contractor contractor, JV member, sub-contractor, or management contractor for at least the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.		Experience						
	2	General experience: Experience under construction contracts in the role of prime contractor, JV member, sub-contractor, or management contractor for at least the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.		œ	×	×	×	ĸ

to the way

					CHARLE S STATISTICS		
No.	Evaluation Criteria	Уштрег	Shodeb Engineering GWWC-1 JV with Dedefo Tenesbo WWC-1	Tinsa'e Ashok Kumar WWGC-1	Adugna Ljigu Hordofa GC-3	Yabcos Construction & Engineering WWC-1	Oda Construction PLC GC-5 JV with Bonny Degebass GWWC-3
ri e	Specific construction and contract Management experience: The bidder must have successfully executed at least one contract in the last five (5) years (2020 to 2024 G.C.) with a minimum amount of 40 million ETB and must be substantially completed or two Contracts each at least 20 million ETB and total 40 million ETB of the two contracts.  The Bidder has successfully Participated as prime local contractor in similar irrigation construction works of similar nature and complexity, such as irrigation system, Water supply, Drainage Or similar water related works.		NR	æ	ž	×	×
100 mm share			æ	ex.	<b>E</b>	DÉ.	×
100	General Construction Work methodology:						
100	a, Site Visit report and verification letter from the district		×	pκ	×	R	×
	h, Work scheduk		- 1				
90	Material Flow Master Schedule		24 1	n<	N N	N. a	× a
	Human Resources Master Schedule		× 67	× 5	NR	2 2	2 24
	Cash Flow Master Schedule		TAIN.	¢ o	0	2	00
	Construction schedule methodology		×	4 6	4	NIN NIN	5 0
	C. Equipment Resources Master Schedule		NR	24	NR	NK	K

21 Page

Se my

1		-		Bi	Bidder's Name		THE SAME
No.	Evaluation Criteria	Number	Shodeb Engineering GWWC-1 JV with Dedefo Tenesho WWC-1	Tinsa'e Ashok Kumar WWGC-1	Adugas Ijiga Hordofa GC-3	Vaheos Construction & Engineering WWC-1	Oda Construction PLC GC-5 JV with Bouny Degebass GWWC-3
	The Committee of Committee	-	8	Я	R	R	24
	6. Environmental, Climate & sateguara spectras		4	c	0	N.P.	200
	7. Social Specilist & Site Organizer	-	R	K	۷	VIV	
	Companient Promosed for the work	No.					
		-	os.	24	W.	nt.	DÉ:
	L'Chain Excavator (0.5mb and above)		9	2	DE	×	æ
	2.Dump truck (14m3 & above)	7	4	5 1			0
	3 Double Cabin 4WD(4 person /10 Quintal)	ci	R	×	×	Y.	4
	A Concepto minore 250,500 litter conscity)	74	24	ps.	×	ed.	es:
	4.000ctob the services of the services	e	0	a.	al	24	Я
	5. Hand compactor	7	4			0	D
	6. Vihestor	ri	×	A	Y .	4 4	0
	To V section of the s	61	66	od	×	X	8
	/Thewatering pulm	1.000	D	н	86	24	R
	8. Surveying equipment, Total station	1 301	4				c
1	9.Surveying equipment , leveling	1 set	м	Я	×	¥	4
cioli.	SSINIAL DESCRIPTION OF THE GRAND		NR	×	NR	NR	×

X A

OVER ALL RESPONSIVINESS

### 4.4. Remarks on Technical evaluation

Following the preliminary assessment, technically compliant bids reviewed against the criteria outlined in Section III: Evaluation and Qualification Requirements of the Bidding Document. The objective of this phase is to determine whether bidders possess the technical, work methods, financial, and human resource capacity to successful execute the proposed works.

After a detailed assessment, the following three (3) bidders were determined to be non-responsive at the technical evaluation stage due to significant deficiencies in documentation, qualifications, and non-compliance with submission formats. Detailed justifications provided below:

# 1) Shodeb Engineering GWWC-1 JV with Dedefo Tenesho WWC-1

- Financial Documentation Non-compliance: The required evidence of access to cash flow submitted only by one partner in the joint venture, rather than as a consolidated financial representation of all JV members, as stipulated in the bidding requirements. This undermines the financial assessment of the joint entity.
- Audit Reports: The audit reports for the years 2020–2024 GC were provided only by one JV member. However, under joint venture arrangements, financial statements must reflect the combined capacity of all partners. This partial submission renders the documents inadmissible.
- Experience Records: Similarly, the specific construction experience and contract management records submitted only for a single partner, not collectively for the JV. As per evaluation requirements, such experience must represent the combined capacity of all JV members. This oversight indicates noncompliance with core qualification criteria.
- Work Planning Deficiency: The Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule was not prepared or submitted using the prescribed project software, nor were the required planning and resource allocation tools included. This omission compromises the ability to evaluate the bidder's project readiness and resource planning.

Due to the absence of combined JV submissions for key financial and technical criteria, as well as missing work planning documentation, this bid deemed non-responsive at the technical stage.

### 2) Adugna Ijigm Hordofa GC-3

- Lack of Experience: The bidder failed to provide any valid evidence of general construction or specific project experience, which are essential prerequisites for demonstrating technical capacity.
- Fraudulent Financial Documentation: The audit reports, average annual turnover, and construction turnover submissions were determined to be non-existent and fabricated. These falsified records represent a serious violation of bidding ethics and procurement integrity.

9

Mariana de la companya de la company

- Missing Work Plans: The bidder did not submit the Material, Human Resource, Equipment, Cash Flow Master Schedule, or a valid Construction Methodology using the required project software tools. The complete absence of these fundamental planning documents made it impossible to assess the bidder's practical execution strategy.
- Given the lack of verifiable experience, submission of forged financial documents, and failure to submit essential work plans, this bid classified as non-responsive and rejected at the technical evaluation stage.

# 3) Yabcon Construction & Engineering WWC-1

- Missing Code of Conduct: The bidder did not submit the Code of Conduct for Contractor Personnel, which is required to be prepared using the official bidding form and must include signed agreements between the bidder and all proposed key experts. This document is critical for ensuring contractor compliance with Environmental, Social, Health, and Safety (ESHS) standards, including commitments to prevent Sexual Exploitation and Abuse (SEA) and Gender-Based Violence (GBV).
- Personnel Licensing: The Social Specialist and Site Organizer proposed in the bid lacked valid professional licenses, thereby failing to meet the minimum qualification requirements for these positions.
- Incomplete Work Schedules: The bidder did not prepare or submit the Material and Equipment Master Schedules using the designated project software. These schedules are vital to evaluate the bidder's resource planning, mobilization timeline, and project execution framework.
- Due to missing compliance documentation, unlicensed key personnel, and failure to provide required project schedules, the bidder found to be non-responsive in the technical evaluation stage.

The above-listed bidders failed to meet one or more essential technical evaluation criteria. Their submissions either lacked required documentation, included unverifiable or fraudulent information, or were incomplete in terms of personnel, planning, or compliance standards. As a result, these bids rejected from further consideration in accordance with the rules and criteria established in the Bidding Documents

7

WS

15mg



# 4.5. Financial Evaluation results

Following the completion of the financial evaluation in accordance with the World Bank procurement guidelines and the PACT project's procurement procedures, the recommended least evaluated bidder identified as follows:

Table 7: Financial evaluation results of Rorisa SSIP

		Read out price			Price adjusted	after arith	metic check	Ranks
N o	Name of the Contractors	With Out VAT	After Rabbet (%)	With VAT (15%)	With Out VAT	After Rabbet (%)	With VAT (15%)	
1	Oda Construction PLC GC-5 JV with Bonny Degebass GWWC-3	50,080,580.98		57,592,668.12	58,080,613.59		66,792,705.63	1 <sup>34</sup>
2	Tinsa'e Ashok Kumar WWGC-1	67,128,917.30		77,198,254.90	62,762,642.21		72,182,788.55	204

The recommended bidder submitted a substantially responsive bid in the technical evaluation and passed all qualification requirements.

The evaluated bid price is determined after applying all necessary adjustments in accordance with the bidding documents.

To

n2

\* Foot



### 4.6. Recommendation of the Evaluation

Accordingly, the evaluation team recommended that the lowest evaluated bid (preliminary, technical financial and Financial evaluation) successful bidder called Oda Construction PLC GC-5 JV with Bonny Degebass GWWC-3 with the total price after arithmetic check of ETB 66,792,705.63 (Sixty Six Million Seven Hundred Ninety Two Thousand Seven Hundred Five and 63/100).

Name & Signature of the Evaluation Committee

5. Lot-11 (Wachuge SSIP) evaluation and qualification criteria

5.1. Preliminary evaluation and qualification criteria

Table 8: Preliminary evaluation result

	2/1/1	- P.	61	m	च	4
	Name of the Contractors	Tesfaye Mosisa Gemeda GC-5	Pavilios GC & WWC -3	Meseret Mokanin WWC-3	Abdulaziz Umar WWC.3	Abraham Dereje GC & GCWW WWC-3
	yridanocia/V	×	200	×	~	04
	Remain To faithnes	×	×	æ	×	≃.
	GAPI voq an yrifidigifH	×	24	æ	ac	~
	Government Owned Entity	ĸ	οs	×	×	×
Eligibilit	United Nation Resolution	×	2	×	×	×
billity	History of non-preforming	×	24	×	×	В
	Suspension based on execution of bid securing declaration by Employer or withdrawal of the bid within bid validity	×	×	×	×	æ
	Pending litigation	丝	24	×	04	$\simeq$
	Litigation History	×	丝	œ	~	œ
	Letter of Bid	×	×	×	×	24
	VAT Registration Certificate	×	×	œ	æ	ot
Ve	Valid Trade license or Business organization Registration	N.	×	丝	ĸ	200
Verification	Valid Tax Clearance Certificate	ĸ	ot	×	24	24
ion	Renewed for 2017 E.C. WWC or GWWC or GC Grade 5 & above	æ	æ	24	×	×
	Bid Security	æ	oc	×	œ	od
	Declaration of Power of Attorney	æ	œ	×	æ	×
Com m	Signed & sealed	25	×	DK.	×	2
Completeness of Bid	No. of copy, technical & financial de document	a	oć	œ	ps.	æ
Environmental Social requirements	Declaration: environmental and socias(ES) Past Performance	00	ж	×	EK.	×
ntal' ents	Benk's SEA and /or SH disqualification	×	~	ac.	×	R
	Overall Responsiveness	2	œ	~	200	24

27 | Page

R

T

M

	5531	Overall Responsiven	NR	N		×	×	~	N.	0	
nds and		Bank's SEA and for SH disqualification	st	2		M.	R	ps.	ž	ž p	4
Environmentali Social requirements	p	Declaration: environmental an	ď	p	4	×	R	oz.	9	É	4
Completeness of Bid	Įv.	No. of copy, technical & financi financial	×	4	×	×	22	22		×	×
Comp	t	balsas & bangi2	œ		04	24	œ		4 0	25	25
	A	Declaration of Power of Attoms	×		×	×	D		4	p4	æ
	1	Biq Security	×		æ	×	D		×	-	06
Ę	2	GWWC or GC Grade 5 & above	×		æ	œ		4	×	2	DE.
Verification	-	Valid Tax Cleanance Confidente			nc nc	×		× .	~	×	R
Veri		Valid Trade license or Business organization Registration	24		æ	pc		×	oc		×
	ŀ	VAT Registration Certificate	æ		×	×		×	od .	oc.	ex.
	1	Letter of Bid	Ř		×	64		od .	24	夏	×
	+	Unitabilia History	×		×	×		× .	24	ž,	pt.
	1	Pending hitgarlon	12		ø	ox		oć.	×	ž	24
		To motive and the post of the continues of the year of the section of the set to the set of the set of the set of the post of the set of th	100		NR	56		æ	pr	æ	2
lity		History of non-preforming	p	4	æ	00		æ	ρú	od	×
Eligibility		United Nation Resolution	2	Y.	œ			×	œ	œ	×
-		Government Owned Entity	92	N.	2	a		od	ద	sk.	×
		Eligibility as per IFAD		×	ž	à	4	æ	nd	×	×
		testaint le faifhnea		×	œ	0	2	œ	ρď	pć	24
	*	Nationality		er.	×		×	94	×	×	04
		Name of the Contractors	Mootim.	Karmus WWC PLC	ABEAM Engineering	W W CRC-3	Hill Construction GC-2	SYG WWC PLC-4	KEPAD Construction PLC WWC-1	Niguse Kidane WWGC-3	Awash Construction PLC
		100	- CO	78.9.	18	1	00	9	91	=	- 8

28 Pagc

	Kuthon Constructi W.k. Constructi PLC WWC-5	Worknets Gizaw	Tibeb GC & V
The state of the s	T Sign	4	1

	Overall Responsiveness	~	×	Z.	œ	Z	×
ental/ ents	HS 10\ ban ASS s'AnsB disqualification	×	×	×	×	×	ac
Environmentals Social requirements	Declaration: carvironmental and peclaration: Past Performance	×	ж	œ	ж	×	æ
Completeness of Bid	No. of copy, technical & financial document	es.	R	æ	В	Я	В
S	Signed & sealed	丝	oc	×	œ	26	æ
	Declaration of Power of Attorney	×	ĸ		×	×	oc
	Bid Security	od.	×	DZ.	od	×	
uoj	Renewed for 2017 E.C WWC or GWWC or GC Grade 5 & above	ď	×	×	×	×	×
Verification	Valid Tax Clearance Certificate	æ	×	24	æ	×	×
Ver	Valid Trade license or Business on Registration	αć	×	æ	æ	Ħ	×
	VAT Registration Certificate	oć.	×		DC	×	æ
	Letter of Bid	~	×	N.	DC.	NK	æ
	yioziH noingiti.I	nd.	òc	24	~	×	æ
	noinsyitil gaibnof	×	~	nd	pc.	×	×
	Suspension based on execution of bid securing declaration by Employer or withdrawal of the bid within bid validity	æ	œ	æ	×	×	od
Eligibility	History of non-preforming	×	×	×	æ	26	×
Ellei	United Nation Resolution	×	24	æ		ž	×
	Government Owned Entity	ፚ	×	R	×	ž	24
	GATI 194 as yrillidigil3	04	œ	×	×	×	06
400	Issnalni lo taillineo	æ	×	24	nd.	×	æ
	ynianotra/	200	×	ĸ	DC.	×	~
	Name of the Contractors	Kembon Construction JV with Wrk Construction Trading PL WWC-5	Workneh Gizaw WWC-3	Tibeb GC & WWC plc JV Lerra Edae	Phexiros Masfin JV Relish Trading	Akimu Construction Engineering WWC-1	Burka Gemechu WWC-3
	ž /	0 - 15m	7.3	2	91	11	

Non-responsiveness

	essnovizaogeoM IlsrovO	×	×	œ	24
entali 1 sents	HS 10/ hin AHS s'MnBH disquelification	R	×	×	06
Environmental Social requirements	Declaration: environmental and social(ES) Past Performance	и	×	×	æ
Completeness of Bid	No. of copy, technical & financial document	æ	æ	æ	R
Com	Signed & sealed	×	200	oc.	×
	Declaration of Power of Attorney	200	æ	×	86
	Bid Security		×	×	×
non	Renewed for 2017 E.C. WWC or GWWC or GC Grade 5 & above	×	24	ద	æ
Verification	Valid Tax Cleanance Certificate	ać.	pć	×	R
Ve	Valid Trade licerse or Business organisation Registration	æ	æ	ex	2
	VAT Registration Certificate	oc.	od	nt	æ
	Letter of Bid	æ	2	oź.	~
	Violei History	os.	od	oκ	×
	Pending litigation	×	×	R	2
	Suspension based on execution of bid securing declaration by Employer or withdrawal of the bid validity	æ	×	×	pc.
dlity	History of non-preforming	M	×	24	04
Eligibility	United Nation Resolution			×	04
	Government Owned Entity	pd.	×	~	×
	Eligibility as per IFAD	×	DC:	æ	04
200	tanatni to railinoa	RG.	24	a	æ
	VallanoiteV	64	nc	æ	24
	Name of the Contractors	Kenbon Taye WWC-5	Fenet Gemeda WWC-3	JOO Construction	Walterell Bekele JV Vatani
			344	1	,03

B

### 5.2. Remark on the Preliminary Evaluation

In accordance with the procedures outlined in the Instructions to Bidders (ITB) and Section IV of the IFAD Bidding Document, a comprehensive preliminary evaluation was conducted to assess the administrative compliance, completeness, and eligibility of submitted bids. Bidders who failed to meet the minimum requirements or deviated from critical submission standards were considered non-responsive and were not advanced to the technical evaluation stage.

The evaluation results determined that seven (7) bidders did not meet the requirements. Below is a detailed justification for the disqualification of each:

# 1. Kanenus WWC PLC

- The Letter of Bid was incomplete and improperly filled, with the following specific issues: Serial No. 6: The Bid Validity Period was not correctly stated in accordance with ITB Clause 21.1. Serial No. 7: The Performance Security (including Environmental and Social requirements) was altered and not correctly fulfilled, violating ITB Clause 47.1. Serial No. 19: The section designating the Adjudicator was not properly completed, contradicting ITB Clause 49.1.
- Additionally, the bidder failed to submit key eligibility documents: The Government-Owned Entity Declaration and United Nations Sanctions Resolution, required under Forms ELI 1.1 and ELI 1.2, were not provided. The History of Non-Performing Contracts, using Form CON-2, was also missing, limiting the evaluators' ability to assess the bidder's performance history.

### 2. ABEAM Engineering

- No valid Letter of Bid was submitted in accordance with the official IFAD Section IV Bidding Forms. Several critical sections were either omitted or incorrectly completed, including: Bid Validity Period (inconsistent with ITB 21.1), Performance Security (altered and substituted, violating ITB 47.1), Eligibility Declaration (not in accordance with IFAD eligibility standards), Adjudicator Appointment (not correctly fulfilled under ITB 49.1).
- The bidder also omitted mandatory declarations in the Letter of Bid related to: Disqualification due to execution of Bid Securing Declaration by the employer, Bank-related disqualification under SEA/SH (Sexual Exploitation, Abuse, and Harassment) concerns.
  These omissions constitute significant non-compliance with IFAD's procurement requirements.

# 3. Niguse Kidane WWGC

The Letter of Bid was not in the standard form and was found to be altered, substituted, and included inappropriate content. For example, the bidder named a contractor as the Adjudicator, which violates both procedural and ethical norms.

31 | Page

Ju m

- Critical declarations were not completed: No confirmation regarding Bank's SEA/SH disqualification.
- The form for Pending Litigation and Litigation History was improperly filled, with check boxes left unmarked or marked incorrectly, thereby failing to present accurate legal standing.
- The form for Environmental and Social Past Performance also lacked proper responses and checkboxes were not selected in the correct fields, rendering the form invalid.

These combined deficiencies indicated a lack of responsiveness to key eligibility and compliance criteria.

### 4. Tibeb GC and WWC PLC JV with Lema Edae GC and WWC

- The Performance Security amount for Environmental and Social obligations (2%), as stated in the Letter of Bid, was incorrectly filled and below the required minimum, which violates ITB Clause 47.1.
- The section concerning commissions, gratuities, or fees was improperly completed with unnecessary or ambiguous information, instead of declaring "None" as required. This raised concerns about transparency and integrity in the bid submission.
- > Such deviations from the bidding document's standard format rendered the bid non-compliant.

# 5. Akimu Construction Engineering WWC

- The Letter of Bid was altered, with changes to the original wording of the bidding form, which is a direct violation of ITB Clause 15.1 that requires submission of the unaltered standard forms.
- The bidder also failed to submit: The Government-Owned Entity Declaration and the United Nations Sanctions Declaration, required in Forms ELI 1.1 and ELI 1.2. These are essential to verify the legal and eligibility status of the firm under IFAD-financed procurement.
- Due to both form alterations and missing eligibility documents, the bid was classified as non-responsive.

The above-mentioned bidders failed to meet the minimum submission, eligibility, or procedural requirements outlined in the bidding documents. The non-compliances ranged from missing or improperly filled Letters of Bid, altered bidding formats, inadequate performance securities, to omitted mandatory declarations and eligibility forms.

As a result, all seven bidders were deemed non-responsive and were excluded from further consideration in the technical evaluation stage, in accordance with the IFAD procurement framework and the terms of the Bidding Documents.

The following seventeen (17) bidders found to have met all preliminary requirements and therefore advanced to the Technical Evaluation stage:

J.

und the state of t

5.3. Technical Evaluation and Qualification Criteria Table 9: Lot-11(Wachuge) Technical Evaluation results

	a,	5.1	2.1.1	1		n
	Evaluation Criteria	Financial Situation and Performance	Access to Cash flow of the bidder ( 5,000,000 ETB)	Audit report for the last 5 years(2020-2024 GC)	Average annual construction turnover:  Minimum average annual construction turnover of ETB 20 million calculated as total certified payments  proceived for contracts in progress and/or europicted within the last 5 years from (2020 – 2024 G.C.) years, divided by 5 years.	Average annual turnover:  The average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments received for contracts completed within the last 5 years (from 2020 to 2024 G.C.) most be 29 million bir.  Bidders must present a letter of evidence and
	Зашры					
	Zeslaye Mosisa Gemeda GC-5		ac	NR	× ×	#
	Pavillon GC & WWC 3		ac	N	at	od
	Meseret Moleonin WWC-3		K	ž	pt of	#
	Abdulilazis Unsar Hojiusman WWC-3		W.	2	×	#
	SAC MMC MC+	H	06	24	×	× ×
	KEFAD Construction PLC	T	Î			
	Awash Constitution plc	T	26	N.	×	₹ 54
	Burka Gemechu WWC-3	t	25	ni ni		ad.
Bade	Kenbon Taye WWC-5	H	200	NR NR	z z	×
Bidder's Name	SaiberT	t	2.4		#	N.
ille	IJOO Construction	t	20	R	N. H	ž
	Abraham Dereje GC & GCWW -3			NR	2	- 100
	Fenet Gemeda WWC-3	T	ac	24	~	~
	Morkoch Cizaw WWC-3	Ť	R	R	Ħ	N.
	Centon Construction & Trading JV with Wak Construction Trading PLC WWC:5		nd	DE.	æ	×
	dutunch Bekele JV with Yatani Con. Pic	v	NR	pć.		×
	CC-2 HIJI, Construcțion MMC-1 &		<sub>ed</sub>	H	≈	ed







(	- A
The state of the s	Specific con
	experience
The same of the car	The bidder n
AL CONTRACTOR	me contract
C ST	G.C.) with:
100	and must be
	Contracts or
Total Marie	million ETF
	The Bidder

-	ģ	2 2 0	f	-	McSumming of the season of the
	Evaluation Criteria	notifications of Amund furnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax payers branch office.	Experience	General experience: Experience under construction contracts in the role of prime contractor, IV member, sub-contractor, of management contractor for at least the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.	Specific construction and contract Management experience.  The bidder must have successfully executed at least one contract in the last five (5) years (2020 to 2024 G.C.) with a minimum amount of 20 million ETB and must be substantially completed or two Contracts each at least 10 million ETB and solal 20 million ETB of the two contracts.  The Bidder has successfully Participated as prime tocal contractor in similar inigation construction
	Number	22			# 12.700m
	8-DD nbomeD nalsoM synlest			N.	N.
	Pavillon GC & WWC -3			×	~
	Meseret Mokonin WWC-3			æ	≪
	Abdulilaziz Umar Hojiusmun WWC-3			οú	×
	SAC MAC SEC-1			, pr	n¢ .
	MMC-I KELVD Construction PLC			æ	œ
	Awash Constituction plt			ex to	×
	Burka Gemeelin WWC-3			pt	α
Bi	Kenhon Taye WWC-5			æ	×
Bidder's Name	field Vt afterM seriesdy			簽	ž
same	1300 Coastruction		1	ž	ž
	Abraham Dereje GC & GCWW			丝	06
	Fenet Comeda WWC-3		+	<b>#</b>	Ψ.
	Worknet Gizaw WWC-3		L		ω.
18:	Kembon Construction & Tradim JV with Wat Construction Trading PLC WWC-5			Ĕ	×
in	Muluneh Bekele JV with Yatm Con. Ple			at	*
4	Hill Construction WWC-1 &			os	∞

ğ	×	3	M	5	×	8	3	-
	1	3	AGO.	an d	Bio.	3		
i	1	0	30	-11	Thy.	4	2	
1		1	8	dil		219		Г
l	The	3	8		A	2		)
١		3	N	18	- Feb	3	200	
	1	See.	Op,	Ant.	of the	0	/	٨
		1	Tall	t de	(S)D			

	ģ		10 mm - 176/	1	w	Y		
	Evaluation Criteria	irrigation system, Water supply, Drainage Or similar water related works,	Cost Break Down (Detailed Breakdown of prices)  Kill Breakdown of the basic prices for labour (converted into currency indicated in SCC)  Kill Breakdown of basic supply prices for materials and consumables (converted into currency indicated in SCC)  Kill Breakdown of basic bourly prices for equipment (converted into currency indicated in SCC)  Kill Breakdown of basic bourly prices for equipment (converted into currency indicated in SCC)  Kill Breakdown of unit prices in the price schedule (converted into currency indicated in SCC)  Kill Breakdown of Site Costs (converted into currency indicated in SCC)	General Coestruction Work methodology:	a, Site Visit report and verification letter from the district	b.Work schedule	Material Flow Master Schedule	Human Resources Master Schedule
	Number							
	8-35 absens5 asisoM system?		≃ ≃		est		DC.	N
	Pavillen GC & WWC-3		26		86		ex	×
	Meserel Mokonin WWC-3		ac		nd		æ	ž
	Abdalilazix Umar Rojiusman NWC-3		06		nt.		×	×
	SAC MMC LICH		₩		at		n:	×
	NEEVD Construction PLC		æ		ed		×	æ
	Awash Constituction ple		×		200		ox.	×
	Витка Септести WWC-3		<b>×</b>		2		as	×
Bid	Kenbon Taye WWC-5		ec .		2	T	NE	ž
Bidder's Name	fileston Maching Physical Solitors		×		m¢	Г	ž	NR.
ame	IJOO Construction		2		<b>E</b>		oi.	NA
	Abraham Dereje GC & GCWW		œ		œ		NR	NR
	Fence Gemeda WWC-3		×		oc		pi	н
	Workneh Gisaw WWC-3		<u> </u>		æ		NR	NR
	Kembon Construction & Trading JV with Wak Construction Trading PLC WWC-5		est est		æ		NR	NR
	Mulunch Bekele JV with Yntani Con. Ple		es		œ		αú	×
	CC-2 Hill Construction WWC-1 &		×		œ		æ	æ

K

d.

	ď.				And the state of t	1-				L
	Evaluation Criteria	Cash Flow Master Schefule	Construction schedule methodology	C. Equipment Resources Master Schedule	Code of conduct: Environmental, social, health and safety (ESHS): Code of conduct: Environmental, social (including sexual exploitation and abuse (SEA) and gender-tased violence (GBV), health and safety plans should be prepared with Matrix and submitted. This should be prepared with Matrix and submitted. This can be written by stating what are the social, health and environmental problems in connection with irrigation acheme construction and what are the possible remedies or protective measures to be undertaken.	Profession Qualification	L.Project Manager	2.Officer Engineer	3. Site Engineer	4, Construction Forman
	Number					Ž .	-	-	-	74
	Zestaye Mosisa Gemeda (2C-5	NR	ы	NR	os.		æ	06	×	×
	Parilion GC & WWC -3	at.	æ	SZ.	ž		æ	×	nd	85
	Meseret Mokonin WWC-3	NK	×	N.	ρĶ		26	104	×	×
	Abdulilasis Umar Hojinsman	at	ď	æ	æ		œ	pc.	×	×
	SAC MMC FLC4	×	×	œ	oś.		×	pc.	ed.	te,
	MARC-I MARC-I	N.	22	Dú.	×		nd.	at	R	×
	Awarh Constitution ple	N.	œ	œ	pd .		sé	ρέ	æ	×
	Burka Gemecha WWC-3	œ	ps;	æ	est.		×	×	ac.	ost.
	Kenbon Taye WWC-5	NR	R	NR	ž		×	×	×	×
DIGUET S LABORE	dello W. albeald, sortizad?	pc	NR	NR	×		×	os.	×	×
	IJOO Construction	N.	8	X	×		ad	æ	as	ni.
1	Abraham Deveje GC & GCWN	Ä	oś	×	æ		æ	N	NK	NR
-	Fenel Gemeda WWC-3	æ	æ	od.	×		22	R	20	×
	Workneh Giznw WWC-3	06	æ	ž	Δ.		as.	ac.	×	×
10	Kenbon Construction & Tradin JV with Wak Construction Trading PLC WWC-5	NR	ж	N N	×		ж	×	86	os
h	Malunch Bekele JV with Yatan Con. Ple	æ	æ	ed.	06		œ	N.	R	X X
	GC-5	06	66	#	ed .		~	24	20	D.

1	200	60	10 2		OVER
	1			12	201
1	1	30	3	50	制
1/2	3	Ang Aroman	and or	CONT.	/

100	-1		\$-39 upo	P.C-2	WWC-3		111111111111111111111111111111111111111	ou bic	VWC-3	W.C.5	V Relish	molts		W GCWW		E-DAILC-3	struction  & Trading  WWC3	with Valued  4. Trading  WWC-3  WWC-3
ž	Evaluation Criteria	Zmupea	Testaye Mosisa Geme	Pavilion GC & W		Abdulilasis Umar Ho WWC-3	KEEVD Construct	Vessel Constinct	Burka Gemecha V	W sysT nednesi		Laibald series49 gaileat	Phexiros Mading Trading 1300 Constru	gnibutT	Trading 1JOO Construe Abraham Dereje GC	Trading.  JOOLI  Series Described Coll	Trading  JJOO Construct Abraham Dereje GC  4- Fennet Genteda W Workneh Gixaw Y Kenbon Construction	Trading  1JOO Construct  Abraham Dereje GC  f-  Fennet Gemeda W  Workach Gizaw  Kenban Construction
	Surunas	-	R	ad	ac.	R	R	æ	R	×	24	235	R	R	R	R NR	R NR R R	R NR R R R
	6. Environmental, Climate & Safoguard Specilist	-	EZ.	NR	8	W W	84	206	×	×	æ		06	R NB	193	N.	NR R	N8 8 E
	7. Social Specifist & Site Organizer	-	NR	NK	05	H.	25	æ	×	H.	p¢		N.	NR R		Я	R R	R R R
00	Equipment Proposed for the work	S.																
	1 Chain Decomptor (0 Set 3 and abround		200	250	8	N N	×	DE.	×	×	×		a	R		×	R R	R R
	1.CERIO DACAMENT (V.Julia sub-morre)		00	M	8		t	œ	æ	ď	œ		n:	0K	Į,	æ	ax ax	R R R
1	2.Dump truck (14ms & anove)				0		+	×	×	æ	×		×	R	705	Ж	RRRR	R R R
	ADDODGE Cabit + WDI-4 person (10 Quinting)	1		a	100		1	R	a	×	×	1	×	R		K	R	R R R
0	4.Concrete mixel 230-300 men capacity?		4 0	4 4		9		a	E	×	12	1	R			R	R R	R R
P	5. Hand compactor	4 0	5 0	4 0	4 0	T	+	a	B	00	œ	tr	×	8 8		×	10 K	R R R
81	6.Vibrator	4	8	¥	2	1	t	6 6		0	10	t		t	d	0 0	2 2	2 2
141	7 Dewatering pump	-1	ai.	×	×	K.	K K	×	×	×	K	+	2		4	4	4	4
7	8.Surveying equipment, Total station	- ¥	×	×	æ	25	M	26	M	200	pd.		ec .	R		ď	æ	ec ec
1	9.Surveying equipment Jereling	- 8	-04	ed.	R	H	R	ox.	ot	œ	-		54		×	e 1	ed	24
Variable	ALIEN AL DECENDED TO THE PER		NR	NR	NR	×	R R	NR	R	NR	NR		N.	NR NR	NR NR R	NR	NR NR R NR NR	NR R NR

responsiveness

8/3

3

A

### 5.4. Remark on the Technical Evaluation

Following the detailed technical evaluation, the following twelve (12) bidders were disqualified for noncompliance with the technical requirements outlined in the bidding document. Specific justifications for each bidder's rejection are summarized below:

## 1) Tesfaye Mosisa

- The claimed general and specific construction experiences were inconsistent with the company's legally established date.
- Documents for Average Annual Construction Turnover and Average Annual Turnover submitted by the Ministry of Revenue were not aligned with the trade license year (2016 EC), further supporting indications of document tampering.
- Key technical documents such as Human Resource, Cash Flow, and Equipment Master Schedule were not prepared or submitted using the required project software, violating submission protocols.

### 2) Pavilion GC and WWC

- The submitted audit report was issued by a private auditor lacking a valid trade license, making the report invalid.
- The Environmental, Social, Health, and Safety (ESHS) Code of Conduct was not submitted, a required compliance element.
- > The Equipment Master Schedule was not prepared or submitted via project software.
- Key experts including the Environmental/Climate Safeguard Specialist, Social Specialist, and Site Organizer lacked valid professional licenses, rendering the team unqualified.

### 3) Meseret Mokonin WWC

- Audit report done by private auditor, which is not authorized auditor and became accountant this is not acceptable as per the requirement.
- Unprofessional Scheduling: Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule did not prepared and submitted using project software.

### 4) Kenbon Taye WWC

- Private Auditor's License Issue: The private auditor's lack of trade and professional license resulted to unaccentable outcomes.
- Code of conduct: Environmental, Social, Health and Safety (ESHS) did not submitted.
- Unprofessional Scheduling: Material, Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule did not prepared and submitted using project software.

# 5) Phexiros Masfin JV with Relish Trading

The bidder claimed project experience from a fictitious entity, "Engineering Corporation of Oromia", for the so-called Dodota SSIP, which amounts to fraudulent claims..

- Unrealistic Turnover: Average Annual construction turnover and annual turnover indicated information on letter from Ministry of Revenue Tax Payer Branch office did not coincided and unacceptable.
- Private Auditor's License Issue: The private auditor's lack of trade and professional license resulted to unacceptable outcomes.
- Unprofessional Scheduling: Material, Human Resource and Equipment Master Schedule did not prepared and submitted using project software.

# 6) IJOO Construction

- > Lack of Experience: General and Specific Experiences non-compliance with company establishment.
- Unrealistic Turnover: The Average Annual Construction Turnover and Average Annual Turnover letters from the Ministry of Revenue Tax Payer Branch office reveal noncompliance with company establishments, indicating fraud and forgery.
- Unprofessional Scheduling: Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule did not prepared and submitted via project software.

# 7) Abraham Dereje GC & GCWW

- Material, Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule did not prepared and submitted via project software.
- Audit Report Issue: The audit report, which was prepared by a private auditor who was not an authorized auditor but instead became an accountant, is not acceptable according to the requirement.
- Unsigned Expert CVs: All CV of expert did not authorized by signature of company owner or representative.
- Unlicensed Key Personnel: Social Specialist and Site Organizer have not professional license.

### 8) Worknesh Gizaw WWC

- Average construction turnover and annual turnover did not meet the minimum requirement.
- Technical Planning Issues: Like many others, the implementation schedule was missing proper project software formatting in Material, Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule.
- Unsigned Expert CVs: All experts CV and project manager CV did not signed by experts themselves and by authorized company owner or representative.
- Tax Payer Evidence Issue: Tax Payer evidence letter and document of professionals and experts not submitted and justified from custom and revenue.
- Technical Planning Issues: Like many others, the implementation schedule was missing proper project software formatting in Material, Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule
- Unlicensed Key Personnel: The site organizer and social expert lacked valid licenses.

gu

n

acctument to the second

# 9) Kenbon Construction & Trading JV with Wak Construction & Trading PLC

- Lack of Joint Venture Experience: Wak Construction failed to present general experience independently, which is mandatory in a joint venture arrangement.
- > Technical Planning Issues: Like many others, the implementation schedule was missing proper project software formatting in Material, Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule
- > Unlicensed Key Personnel: The site organizer and social expert lacked valid licenses.

# 10) Awash Construction PLC

- > Missing Auditor Credentials: The audit firm did not submit a valid license.
- > Company Turnover Unfulfilled: Average turnover not met required amount.
- Cash Flow Scheduling Issue: No proper software-supported schedule for cash flow master schedule.

# 11) Muluneh Bekele JV with Yatani Construction PLC

- Incomplete Financial Access Statement: Only one JV partner submitted cash flow data, which is noncompliant—both parties should have done so collectively.
- Unsigned Expert CVs: Several professionals' CVs (e.g., Forman, Social Specialist and Organizer, Environmental, Climate and Safeguard Specialist) lacked the required company representative's countersignature.
- Expired/Doctored Professional License: One license (office engineer) was expired and appeared to be digitally altered, raising concerns about forgery.
- Fake Contract Agreement: The agreement between the company and its surveyor expert was valid for only one day, which is not acceptable under any professional arrangement.

# 12) Hilif Construction WWC-1 & GC-5

- The Letter of Bid was missing key information, including the proposed Adjudicator, as required under as per ITB BDS 49.1.
- Several mandatory fields in the Letter of Bid (e.g., #14) were left blank, despite clear instructions in as per ITB 9.4 requiring bidders to complete all forms. The failure to provide all essential information constitutes non-responsiveness.

for

w

Kong

# 5.6. Recommendation of the Evaluation

Name & Signature of the Evaluation Committee

Accordingly, the evaluation team recommended that the lowest evaluated bid (preliminary, technical financial and Financial evaluation) successful bidder called Fenet Gemeda WWC-3 with the total price after arithmetic check of ETB 49,414, 892.65 (Forty Nine Million Four Hundred Fourteen Thousand Eight Hundred Ninety Two and 65/100).