- Missing Work Plans: The bidder did not submit the Material, Human Resource, Equipment, Cash Flow Master Schedule, or a valid Construction Methodology using the required project software tools. The complete absence of these fundamental planning documents made it impossible to assess the bidder's practical execution strategy.
- Given the lack of verifiable experience, submission of forged financial documents, and failure to submit essential work plans, this bid classified as non-responsive and rejected at the technical evaluation stage.

## 3) Yabcon Construction & Engineering WWC-1

- Missing Code of Conduct: The bidder did not submit the Code of Conduct for Contractor Personnel, which is required to be prepared using the official bidding form and must include signed agreements between the bidder and all proposed key experts. This document is critical for ensuring contractor compliance with Environmental, Social, Health, and Safety (ESHS) standards, including commitments to prevent Sexual Exploitation and Abuse (SEA) and Gender-Based Violence (GBV).
- Personnel Licensing: The Social Specialist and Site Organizer proposed in the bid lacked valid professional licenses, thereby failing to meet the minimum qualification requirements for these positions.
- Incomplete Work Schedules: The bidder did not prepare or submit the Material and Equipment Master Schedules using the designated project software. These schedules are vital to evaluate the bidder's resource planning, mobilization timeline, and project execution framework.
- Due to missing compliance documentation, unlicensed key personnel, and failure to provide required project schedules, the bidder found to be non-responsive in the technical evaluation stage.

The above-listed bidders failed to meet one or more essential technical evaluation criteria. Their submissions either lacked required documentation, included unverifiable or fraudulent information, or were incomplete in terms of personnel, planning, or compliance standards. As a result, these bids rejected from further consideration in accordance with the rules and criteria established in the Bidding Documents

F

WS

15mg



# 4.5. Financial Evaluation results

Following the completion of the financial evaluation in accordance with the World Bank procurement guidelines and the PACT project's procurement procedures, the recommended least evaluated bidder identified as follows:

Table 7: Financial evaluation results of Rorisa SSIP

		Read out price			Price adjusted	after arith	metic check	Ranks
No	Name of the Contractors	With Out VAT	After Rabbet (%)	With VAT (15%)	With Out VAT	After Rabbet (%)	With VAT (15%)	
1	Oda Construction PLC GC-5 JV with Bonny Degebass GWWC-3	50,080,580.98		57,592,668.12	58,080,613.59		66,792,705.63	1 <sup>34</sup>
2	Tinsa'e Ashok Kumar WWGC-1	67,128,917.30		77,198,254.90	62,762,642.21		72,182,788.55	204

The recommended bidder submitted a substantially responsive bid in the technical evaluation and passed all qualification requirements.

The evaluated bid price is determined after applying all necessary adjustments in accordance with the bidding documents.

To

n2

Fresh .



#### 4.6. Recommendation of the Evaluation

Accordingly, the evaluation team recommended that the lowest evaluated bid (preliminary, technical financial and Financial evaluation) successful bidder called Oda Construction PLC GC-5 JV with Bonny Degebass GWWC-3 with the total price after arithmetic check of ETB 66,792,705.63 (Sixty Six Million Seven Hundred Ninety Two Thousand Seven Hundred Five and 63/100).

Name & Signature of the Evaluation Committee

5. Lot-11 (Wachuge SSIP) evaluation and qualification criteria

5.1. Preliminary evaluation and qualification criteria

Table 8: Preliminary evaluation result

	Z A S S	Tes	Pav	Me	Ab.	45 O
	Name of the Contractors	Tesfaye Mosisa Gemeda GC-5	Pavilios GC & WWC -3	Meseret Mokanin WWC-3	Abdulaziz Umar WWC.3	Abraham Dereje GC & GCWW WWC-3
	yridanoriaN.	×	200	×	24	DC;
	searstri lo folfinos	×	~	×	×	×.
	Higibility as per IPAD	×	24	×	at	24
	Government Owned Entity	ĸ	οs	~	×	×
Eligibili	United Nation Resolution	丝	×	×	×	×
Offity	History of non-preforming	×	×	œ	R	æ
	Suspension based on execution of bid securing declaration by Employer or withdrawal of the bid within bid validity	×	×	Я	æ	æ
	Pending hiligation	丝	æ	×	œ	×
	Litigation History	×	丝	×	~	œ
	Letter of Bid	ĸ	×	×	×	×
	VAT Registration Certificate	×	×	œ	×	ot
-	Valid Trade license or Business organization Registration	×	×	×	ĸ	os
Verification	Valid Tax Clearance Certificate	ĸ	ot .	×	p£	p4
tion	Renewed for 2017 E.C. WWC or GWWC or GC Grade 5 & above	æ	×	æ	×	×
	Bid Security	æ	96	~	œ	26
	Declaration of Power of Attorney	æ	œ	×	×	×
8	boless & bangi2	24	24	oc.	œ	2
Completeness of Bid	No. of copy, technical & financial document	×	06	×	×	æ
Environmental Social requirements	Declaration: environmental and oscial(ES) Past Performance	oć.	æ	×	ĸ	×
rental/  -  - 	Bank's SEA and /or SH disqualification	œ	ద	ac.	×	В
	Overall Responsiveness	×	<b>2</b>	~	DE	24

27 | Page

K

q

Ans.

	5531	Overall Responsiven	N	N		×	×	~	N.	0			
ntall uts		Bank's SEA and for SH diaqualification	st	2		×	R	ex	ž	ž p	4		
Environmentali Social requirements	regibility  ory of non-preforming  scouring declaration of securing declaration of securing declaration of securing declaration by yet or withdrawal of the declaration by the securing declaration of the Pending litigation  Letter of Bid validity  Trade license or Business semication Registration  Trade license or Business semication Registration  Trade license or Business  Trade license or Business  Signed & sealed  Tax Clemanes Certificate  WC or GC Grade 5 & above  Bid Security  Tax Clemanes A stromey  Signed & sealed  document  document  semical Scounty  document  semical Scounty  A sealed  Signed & sealed  Signed & sealed  Georgical Scounty  A sealed  Signed & sealed  George, technical & financial  Signed & sealed  George, technical and  document  Signed & sealed  A sealed  Signed & sealed  A sealed  Signed & sealed  Or GC Grade S & sealed  A sealed	Declaration: environmental an	ď	p	4	×	24	oz.	9	É	4		
Page 2	T Registration Certificate  or Trade license or Business  or Tax Clearance Certificate  awed for 2017 E.C WWC or  WC or GC Grade 5 & above  Bid Security  Bid Security	No. of copy, technical & financi financial	×	4	×	×	22	22		×	×		
Comp	Mationality  Mationality  Spillity as per IFAD  Red Mation Resolution  Southeast  Confidence of material  Pending litigation  Pending litigation  Pending litigation  Pending litigation  Trade locense or Business  Signed & sealed  Certificate  Bid Security  Tax Clearance Certificate  Registration Certificate  Signed & sealed  Corpy, technical & financial  Completes  Completes  Signed & sealed  Completes  Completes  A within and year stration  Pending litigation  Pending litigation  Pending litigation  Certificate  South Security  Completes  Confidence  Signed & sealed  Confidence  Signed & sealed  Confidence  Co	balsas & bangi2	œ		04	24	œ		4 0	25	25		
	contracts on based on execution of ecuring declaration by yet or withdrawal of the liver of Bidity  Littgation History  Letter of Bid  Trade license or Business anion of Power of Attome  Bid Security  od for 2017 E.C WWC or C or GC Grade 5 & above  Signed & sealed  Signed & sealed  document	Declaration of Power of Attoms	×		×	×	D		4	p4	æ		
	ogganization Registration  lid Tax Clearance Certificate  rewed for 2017 E.C WWC or  Bid Security  Claration of Power of Attorney		×		æ	×	0		×	-	06		
Serial Trade license or Business organization Registration lid Tax Clearance Certificate fig.  Tax Clearance Certificate or 2017 E.C WWC or		×		æ	œ		4	×	2	DE.			
Marionality  Conflict of interest  Figure 1 TAD  Conflict of interest  Conflict of Building  Pending litigation  Pending litigation  Pending litigation  Conflict of the  Pending litigation  Conflict of the  Conflict of the  Conflict of Building  Tager or withdrawal of the  Pending litigation  Conflict of Building  Tager or withdrawal of the  Conflict of Building  Conflict of Building  Conflict of Building  Tager of WWC or  Bid Security  Conflict of Grade 5 & above  Conflict of Grade 5 & above  Signed & sealed  Signed & sealed  Conflict of Antomey  Conflict of Antomey  Conflict of Conflict of Signed Sealed  Signed & sealed  Conflict of Signed Sealed  Signed & sealed  Conflict of Signed Sealed  Signed Sealed  Signed Sealed  Conflict of Antomey  Confliction  Confliction	The second section was to be a second second	1		nc nc	×		× .	~	×	R			
	Valid Trade license or Business or Susiness or Susiness	×		DE.	ex		×	200		×			
	Mationality Conflict of interest Mationality as per IFAD Montment Owned Entity Inted Nation Resolution Securing declaration of A securing declaration of Bed within bid validity Pending litigation Pending	952		×	×		×	od .	oc.	æ			
	+		×		×	64		od .	24	夏	×		
	+	Unitation History	DK.		×	×		× .	od .	ž	px.		
	Ì	Pending hitgarlon	D.		ø	ox		oć.	×	ž	24		
	To not no based not	æ	ps	æ	¥								
lity		continos		4	æ	2		æ	psi	od	×		
Eligibi		Eligibility as per IFAD Government Owned Entity United Nation Resolution				Ä.	œ	od.		×	œ	24	st.
-				200		0	4 0	od	ద	sk.	×		
				Eligibility as per IFAD		×	ž	à	4	æ	nd	×	×
		testaint le faifhnea		×	œ	0	2	œ	ρď	pć	24		
	Nigure Kidne WWGC3  Nigure Kidne Withoutsyn Nigure Withoutsy	04											
	Mationality Conflict of interest Conflict of interest Conflict of interest Wentment Owned Entity Interest Owned Entity Story of non-preforming Gecuring declaration of accuring declaration of bid within bid validity Pending litigation Pending litigation Pending litigation Certificate Certificate Letter of Bid AT Registration Letter of Bid Certificate Occuring Certificate Stockenics or Business Occuring Stockenics Occurity Did Tax Clearance Certificate Occurity Occurity Occurity Did Scounty Did Scounty Did Scounty Did Scounty	Name of the Contractors	Leotem	Karmus WWC PLC	ASEAM Engineering	W W CRC-3	Hilif Construction GC-5		Construction	Niguse Kidane WWGC-3	Awash Construction PLC		
Nationality Conflict of interest conflict of interest inted Nation Resolution of securing declaration by the validinal of the securing declaration by fending litigation between or withdrawal of the bid validin bid validity fending litigation Pending litigation Pending litigation Table the or Business of Table the seistration Bid Security  Bid Security  Bid Security  Selection  Bid Security  Bid Security  Bid Security		30	78.9.	18	1		0.00	10	=	- 8			

28 Pagc

	Kuthon Constructi W.k. Constructi PLC WWC-5	Worknets Gizaw	Tibeb GC & V
The state of the s	T Sign	4	1

	Overall Responsiveness	22	~	Z	×	Z	×
ental/ ents	HS 10\ ban A38 s'AnsB moineadileagailt	<b>~</b>	×	×	×	25	ac
Environmentali Social requirements	Declaration: environmental and sectoristics sectoristics	æ	ж	œ	ж	×	æ
Completeness of Bid	No. of copy, technical & financial document	es.	R	æ	R	Я	В
Com	baleas & bangil?	丝	×	×	œ	24	×
	Declaration of Power of Attorney	×	M		×	×	æ
	Bid Security	od.	×	DZ.	od	×	
uoj	Renewed for 2017 E.C WWC or GWWC or GC Grade 5 & above	ď	×	×	2	×	×
Verification	Valid Tax Clearance Certificate	æ	×	24	æ	×	2
Ver	Valid Trade license or Business organization Registration	αć	×	æ	æ	×	×
	VAT Registration Certificate	oć.	×		DC	×	æ
	Letter of Bid	~	×	N.	DC.	NX	æ
	CosiH noinguid	nd.	òc.	×	~	×	æ
	noinsyifil gaibnof	×	~	DC	pc.	×	×
	Suspension based on execution of bid securing declaration by Employer or withdrawal of the bid within bid validity	æ	œ	æ	×	×	od
bility	History of non-preforming	×	×	æ	æ	26	×
Eligibility	United Nation Resolution	×	×	æ		ž	×
	Government Owned Entity	ፚ	×	ద	×	ž	24
	Eligibility as per IFAD	04	œ	×	×	×	06
400	Issashni To taifhneo	æ	×	24	nd.	×	M
	YnianotiaN.	200	×	ĸ	DC.	×	~
	Name of the Contractors	Kembon Construction JV with Wrk Construction Trading PL WWC-5	Workneh Gizaw WWC-3	Tibeb GC & WWC plc JV Letra Edae	Phexiros Mastin JV Relish Trading	Akimu Construction Engineering WWC-1	Burka Gemechu WWC-3
	2	3 - 15m	7.3	2	91	12	

Non-responsiveness

	essnovizaogeoM IlsrovO	×	×	œ	25
entali 1 sents	HS 10/ hin AHS s'MnBH disquelification	R	×	×	06
Environmental Social requirements	Declaration: environmental and social(ES) Past Performance	и	×	×	×
Completeness of Bid	No. of copy, technical & financial document	æ	æ	×	Ж
Com	Signed & sealed	×	200	oc.	×
	Declaration of Power of Attorney	200	æ	×	26
	Bid Security		×	×	×
non	Renewed for 2017 E.C. WWC or GWWC or GC Grade 5 & above	×	24	ద	æ
Verification	Valid Tax Cleanance Certificate	ac.	DC.	ex	ж
Ve	Valid Trade licerse or Business organisation Registration	æ	æ	æ	2
	VAT Registration Certificate	æ	ox	nd	œ
	Letter of Bid	æ	24	œ	×
	Violaile neiragini.	æ	od	oκ	×
	Pending litigation	×	~	×	~
	Suspension based on execution of bid securing declaration by Employer or withdrawal of the bid within bid validity	æ	æ	×	06
ollity	History of non-preforming	M	×	24	04
Eligibility	United Nation Resolution			×	04
	Government Owned Entity	pt.	×	~	×
	Eligibility as per IFAD	×	DC:	æ	04
200	tentaini to milino	RE	24	×	æ
	ValianoiteV	64	nd	æ	24
	Name of the Contractors	Kenbon Taye WWC-5	Fenet Gemeda WWC-3	JOO Construction	Strlumen Bekele JV Vatani
				1	25

B

### 5.2. Remark on the Preliminary Evaluation

In accordance with the procedures outlined in the Instructions to Bidders (ITB) and Section IV of the IFAD Bidding Document, a comprehensive preliminary evaluation was conducted to assess the administrative compliance, completeness, and eligibility of submitted bids. Bidders who failed to meet the minimum requirements or deviated from critical submission standards were considered non-responsive and were not advanced to the technical evaluation stage.

The evaluation results determined that seven (7) bidders did not meet the requirements. Below is a detailed justification for the disqualification of each:

# 1. Kanenus WWC PLC

- The Letter of Bid was incomplete and improperly filled, with the following specific issues: Serial No. 6: The Bid Validity Period was not correctly stated in accordance with ITB Clause 21.1. Serial No. 7: The Performance Security (including Environmental and Social requirements) was altered and not correctly fulfilled, violating ITB Clause 47.1. Serial No. 19: The section designating the Adjudicator was not properly completed, contradicting ITB Clause 49.1.
- Additionally, the bidder failed to submit key eligibility documents: The Government-Owned Entity Declaration and United Nations Sanctions Resolution, required under Forms ELI 1.1 and ELI 1.2, were not provided. The History of Non-Performing Contracts, using Form CON-2, was also missing, limiting the evaluators' ability to assess the bidder's performance history.

### 2. ABEAM Engineering

- No valid Letter of Bid was submitted in accordance with the official IFAD Section IV Bidding Forms. Several critical sections were either omitted or incorrectly completed, including: Bid Validity Period (inconsistent with ITB 21.1), Performance Security (altered and substituted, violating ITB 47.1), Eligibility Declaration (not in accordance with IFAD eligibility standards), Adjudicator Appointment (not correctly fulfilled under ITB 49.1).
- The bidder also omitted mandatory declarations in the Letter of Bid related to: Disqualification due to execution of Bid Securing Declaration by the employer, Bank-related disqualification under SEA/SH (Sexual Exploitation, Abuse, and Harassment) concerns.
  These omissions constitute significant non-compliance with IFAD's procurement requirements.

# 3. Niguse Kidane WWGC

The Letter of Bid was not in the standard form and was found to be altered, substituted, and included inappropriate content. For example, the bidder named a contractor as the Adjudicator, which violates both procedural and ethical norms.

31 | Page

Ju m

- Critical declarations were not completed: No confirmation regarding Bank's SEA/SH disqualification.
- The form for Pending Litigation and Litigation History was improperly filled, with check boxes left unmarked or marked incorrectly, thereby failing to present accurate legal standing.
- The form for Environmental and Social Past Performance also lacked proper responses and checkboxes were not selected in the correct fields, rendering the form invalid.

These combined deficiencies indicated a lack of responsiveness to key eligibility and compliance criteria.

### 4. Tibeb GC and WWC PLC JV with Lema Edae GC and WWC

- The Performance Security amount for Environmental and Social obligations (2%), as stated in the Letter of Bid, was incorrectly filled and below the required minimum, which violates ITB Clause 47.1.
- The section concerning commissions, gratuities, or fees was improperly completed with unnecessary or ambiguous information, instead of declaring "None" as required. This raised concerns about transparency and integrity in the bid submission.
- > Such deviations from the bidding document's standard format rendered the bid non-compliant.

### 5. Akimu Construction Engineering WWC

- The Letter of Bid was altered, with changes to the original wording of the bidding form, which is a direct violation of ITB Clause 15.1 that requires submission of the unaltered standard forms.
- The bidder also failed to submit: The Government-Owned Entity Declaration and the United Nations Sanctions Declaration, required in Forms ELI 1.1 and ELI 1.2. These are essential to verify the legal and eligibility status of the firm under IFAD-financed procurement.
- Due to both form alterations and missing eligibility documents, the bid was classified as non-responsive.

The above-mentioned bidders failed to meet the minimum submission, eligibility, or procedural requirements outlined in the bidding documents. The non-compliances ranged from missing or improperly filled Letters of Bid, altered bidding formats, inadequate performance securities, to omitted mandatory declarations and eligibility forms.

As a result, all seven bidders were deemed non-responsive and were excluded from further consideration in the technical evaluation stage, in accordance with the IFAD procurement framework and the terms of the Bidding Documents.

The following seventeen (17) bidders found to have met all preliminary requirements and therefore advanced to the Technical Evaluation stage:

J.

und the state of t

5.3. Technical Evaluation and Qualification Criteria Table 9: Lot-11(Wachuge) Technical Evaluation results

	a,	5.1	2.1.1	1	9	n
	Evaluation Criteria	Financial Situation and Performance	Access to Cash flow of the bidder ( 5,000,000 ETB)	Audit report for the last 5 years(2020-2024 GC)	Average annual construction turnover:  Minimum average annual construction turnover of ETB 20 million calculated as total certified payments  Traceived for contracts in progress and/or euroleted within the last 5 years from (2020 – 2024 G.C.) years,  devided by 5 years.	Average annual turnover:  The average annual turnover calculated as total certified payments received for contracts completed within the last 5 years (from 2020 to 2024 G.C.) most be 20 million ber.  Bidders must present a letter of evidence and
	Зашры					
	Zeslaye Mosisa Gemeda GC-5		AC	NR	×	×
	Pavillon GC & WWC 3		ac	N	at	od
	Meseret Moleonin WWC-3		K	ž	oc.	*
	Abdulilazis Unsar Hojiusman WWC-3		R	2	×	×
	SAG WWC PLC-4 SYG WWC PLC-4	H	06	26	nc nc	× ×
	MAC-1	t	Ê			- 1
	Awash Constitution plc	t	26	NR	×	£ 54
	Burka Gemechu WWC-3	t	25	E Z	ac	at at
Bidde	Phexitos Mastin JV Relish Persitos Mastin JV Relish	H	200	NR NR	£	×
Bidder's Name	gaibir/T DOO Construction	H	æ	ox.	N.	Ž
ie.	Abraham Dereje GC & GCWW	-	×	N.	K	×
	E-DVW.53	H	ns	×	×	2
	Mothorth Cizaw WWC-3	H	×	×	Ħ	×
	Combon Construction & Trading Valve VI.  Trading PLC WWC-5	4	nd	DE.	pd:	×
	dulunch Bekele JV with Yatani Con. Pic	ú	NR	pć.	×	×
	GC-2 Hill Construction WWC-1 &		æi	12	₩	ed .







(	-
The state of the s	Specific con
	experience
The state of the car	The bidder n
AL CONTRACTOR	one contract
C Dark	G.C.) with:
TEC 100	and must be
	Contracts or
1	million ETF
	The Bidder

-	d	2 2 0	f	-	Security of
	Evaluation Criteria	notifications of Amund furnover letter issued by the required Ministry of Revenue tax payers branch office.	Experience	General experience: Experience under construction contracts in the role of prime contractor, IV member, sub-contractor, of management contractor for at less the last 5 years, starting 1st January 2020.	Specific construction and contract Management experience.  The bidder must have successfully executed at least one contract in the last five (5) years (2020 to 2024 one contract in the last five (5) years (2020 to 2024 one contract each at least 10 million ETB and sold to million ETB of the two contracts.  The Bidder has successfully Participated as prime tocal contractor in similar intigation construction
	Number	22			A SERVICE AND SERVICE
	8-DD mbomeD nalsoM synlest			N.	N.
	Pavillon GC & WWC -3			×	2
	Meseret Mokonin WWC-3			ď	ec.
	Abdulilaziz Umar Hojinsman WWC-3			oć.	p#
-	SAG MAC SEC-4			E .	od:
	KERAD Construction PLC			æ	œ
	Areash Constituction plt			X A	×
	Burks Gensehn WWC-3			æ	æ
B	Kenhon Taye WWC-5			×	×
Bidder's Name	dellog VI, afterIA serizsalq gaiberT			髮	ž
same	1300 Cosstruction		1	ž	ž
	Abraham Dereje GC & GCWW			±	06
	Fenet Comeda WWC-3		+	×	π.
	Worknets Gizaw WWC-3		L		ω
30	Kembon Construction & Tradin JV with Wak Construction Trading PLC WWC-5			Ĕ	≃ ≃
in	Muluneh Bekele JV with Yatm Con. Ple			at	<b>*</b>
4	Hill Construction WWC-1 &			os	∞

š	B	3	M	5	B	8	3	-
	1	1	AGO.	an d	Bio	3		
1	1	8	3	-1.	Thy.	3	1	
1		1	1	di	o.	V \ 9		٢
k	774	31	8		A	12	PH	)
١	3.1	3	5	18	-114	3	261	
	1	34	G <sub>D</sub>	And Cress	april.	20	1	7
		-	Table	t de	(S)D	The same of		
					*			

	ģ		10 mm - 176/	1	w	Y		
	Evaluation Criteria	irrigation system, Water supply, Drainage Or similar water related works,	Cost Break Down (Detailed Breakdown of prices)  Kill Breakdown of the basic prices for labour (converted into currency indicated in SCC)  Kill Breakdown of basic supply prices for materials and consumables (converted into currency indicated in SCC)  Kill Breakdown of basic bourly prices for equipment (converted into currency indicated in SCC)  Kill Breakdown of basic bourly prices for equipment (converted into currency indicated in SCC)  Kill Breakdown of unit prices in the price schedule (converted into currency indicated in SCC)  Kill Breakdown of Site Costs (converted into currency indicated in SCC)	General Coestruction Work methodology:	a, Site Visit report and verification letter from the district	b.Work schedule	Material Flow Master Schedule	Human Resources Master Schedale
	Number							
	8-DG absens Dasisoff system?		₩		24		nt	N
	Pavillen GC & WWC-3		26		86		ex	×
	Meserel Mokonin WWC-3		ac		nd		æ	ž
	Abdalilazix Umar Rojiusman NWC-3		06		nt.		×	×
	SAC MMC LICH		±		at		n:	×
	MAC-1 KELVD Countraction PLC		~		ed		×	æ
	Awash Consrtuction plc		×		2		×	×
	Витка Септести WWC-3		<b>×</b>		2		as	×
Bid	Kenbon Taye WWC-5		ec .		2	T	NE	ž
Bidder's Name	fileston Maching The Reliab		×		m¢	Г	ž	NR.
ame	IJOO Construction		2		<b>E</b>		oi.	NA
	Abraham Dereje GC & GCWW		œ		œ		NR	NR
	Fenck Gemeda WWC-3		×		oc oc		pi.	2
	Worloneh Gizaw WWC-3		es es		#		NR	NR
	Kembon Construction & Trading JV with Wak Construction Trading PLC WWC-5		ppt.		æ		N.	NR
	Mulunch Bekele JV with Yntani Con. Ple		es		œ		αú	×
	CC-2 Hill Construction WWC-1 &		×		œ		æ	æ

K

d.

	ď.				Section Aller	1-				L
	Evaluation Criteria	Cash Flow Master Schedule	Construction schedule methodology	C. Equipment Resources Master Schedule	Code of conduct: Environmental, social, health and safety (ESBS): Code of conduct: Environmental, social (including sexual exploitation and abuse (SEA) and gender-tased violence (GBV), health and safety plans should be prepared with Matrix and submitted. This should be prepared with Matrix and submitted. This can be written by stating what are the social, health and environmental problems in connection with irrigation acheme construction and what are the possible remedies or protective measures to be undertaken.	Profession Qualification	L.Project Manager	2.Officer Engineer	3 Site Engineer	4. Construction Forman
	Number					Ž .	-	-1	-	£4
	Zestaye Mosisa Gemeda GC-5	NR	ш	NE	o4		×	oś.	×	×
	Parilion GC & WWC -3	at	œ	Z Z	ž		×	æ	nd	×
	Meseret Mokonin WWC-3	NR	×	N.	ρ¢	a a a				×
	Abdulllasis Umar Hojinaman	24	N N	R	×		×	26	×	×
	SAC MACEUC	×	×	œ	oi		×	pc.	æ	×
	MAC-I  MAC-I	N.	22	DE.	×		nc nc	ni.	R	×
	old notionstrand denvi.	N.	×	œ	×		×	ni.	æ	×
	Burka Gemecha WWC-3	os	psi	я	as,		×	×	ac.	st.
-	Kenbon Taye WWC-5	NR	H	NR	ž		×	×	×	×
Bidder's Name	dellog VL alteals, sortizad? gaibarT	ac	NR	NR	æ		×	05	×	×
Name	IJOO Construction	Z,	8	N.	×		nd.	×	as	24
	Abraham Deveje GC & GCWW	Ä	od	×	×		×	ĸ	NR	NR
	Fenel Gemeda WWC-3	æ	æ	ad	×		20	R	200	×
-	Workneh Giznw WWC-3	S ≥ ∞ Morkneh Gram W							2	H
10	Kenbon Construction & Tradin JV with Wak Construction Trading PLC WWC-5	NR	R	N N	×		н	æ	26	os.
p	Majunch Bekele JV with Yatan Con. Ple	æ	æ	ed	96		×	NR	В	ž
	GC-5	06	66	#	æ		2	œ	20	DÉ.

1	2 S	10 I	RESERVE OF		OVER
	6	-		100	1
	1	30	3	/ A	制 /
1/2	1	And Something	BATT ON CAN		
		1/47)	UNIV		

-			\$*30°	£	2000		110000	al	£10	5	rfeil	ųsij	MANO			£	E-C) geibert noti	E-3 geibert noti
N.	Evaluation Criteria	Zmupea	Testaye Mosisa Gemeda O	Pavilion GC & WWC-	Meseret Mokonin WW	Abdulilaziz Umar Hojiusi	KEEVD Construction Page 8YG WWC PLC-	Awash Constitution p	Borka Gemecha WWC	Kenbon Taye WWC	Phexicos Marin JV Re	A SECTION AND A	Trading LIOO Construction	DJOO Construction Dereje GC & C	13OO Construction	DOO Construction O & OO steeps GC & C	DIOO Construction  Abraham Dereje GC & C  -3  Fenet Gensela WWC  Workneh Gixaw WWC  Kenben Construction & T  Kenben Construction & T	DJOO Construction  O & CC & C  -3  Fenct Genseds WWC  Worksich Gizsa WWC  T sond Construction & T
	Surrenvog	-	×	H	oc.	R	R	æ	×	×	R		×			NR	NR R R	NR R R R
	6. Environmental, Climate & Safeguard Specifist	-	Ñ.	NR	R	. H	84	26	œ	×	×	100	06	NB NB	193	N.S.	NR R	NR R R
	7. Social Specifist & Site Organizer	-	NK	NR	200	24	24	æ	×	pc.	p¢	N.	100	18		Я	R R	R R R
00	Equipment Proposed for the work	No							_			_						
	1 Chail Descender (O See 3 and abroun)		26	×	M	DÉ.	×	oś	×	×	×	a		×	R		ot	R
	1.CERIO EXCENSION (V.OUS) SUB-BOOVER		0	M	2		t	ox.	Œ	or.	œ	pć		×	24		24	RRR
1	2.Dump truck (14ms & anove)	4 4			. 01			×	CK.	DE.	×	æ		Ж	R	8	RR	R R R
1	3 Double Cabin 4 WD(4 person / 10 Quinnin)	1	4 0	0	0		1	2	a	ex	×	×		×	×		84	24
4	4.Concrete mixer(250-500 inter capacity):		4 0	4 4		9	1	0	tr	a	E	×		×	R		84	84
AP	5. Hand compactor	4 0	5 0	4 0	40	1	+	0	E P	0	a	×		×	İ	İ	R	R R
912	6. Vibrator	7	*	¥	2	1	t	6	4	1	4	-			İ	0	0	0 0
191	7 Dewatering pump	ri	ai	×	×	×	R	*	×	×	×	×	- 1	4		e	4	6
1	8.Surveying equipment, Total station.	- ¥	=	×	8	26	at at	24	22	8	×	æ		œ	æ		æ	æ
30	9.Surveying equipment Jereling	- 8	øš	ed.	R	R	R	DZ.	od	26	-	si		×		at 1	ed	24 E
OVER	OUTD AT I DESPONSIVINESS		NR	NR	NR	×	R R	NR	RR	NR	NR NR	N.	221	NK	NR R	×		R NR

responsiveness

8/3

3

A

#### 5.4. Remark on the Technical Evaluation

Following the detailed technical evaluation, the following twelve (12) bidders were disqualified for noncompliance with the technical requirements outlined in the bidding document. Specific justifications for each bidder's rejection are summarized below:

### 1) Tesfaye Mosisa

- The claimed general and specific construction experiences were inconsistent with the company's legally established date.
- Documents for Average Annual Construction Turnover and Average Annual Turnover submitted by the Ministry of Revenue were not aligned with the trade license year (2016 EC), further supporting indications of document tampering.
- Key technical documents such as Human Resource, Cash Flow, and Equipment Master Schedule were not prepared or submitted using the required project software, violating submission protocols.

### 2) Pavilion GC and WWC

- The submitted audit report was issued by a private auditor lacking a valid trade license, making the report invalid.
- The Environmental, Social, Health, and Safety (ESHS) Code of Conduct was not submitted, a required compliance element.
- > The Equipment Master Schedule was not prepared or submitted via project software.
- Key experts including the Environmental/Climate Safeguard Specialist, Social Specialist, and Site Organizer lacked valid professional licenses, rendering the team unqualified.

### 3) Meseret Mokonin WWC

- Audit report done by private auditor, which is not authorized auditor and became accountant this is not acceptable as per the requirement.
- Unprofessional Scheduling: Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule did not prepared and submitted using project software.

#### 4) Kenbon Taye WWC

- Private Auditor's License Issue: The private auditor's lack of trade and professional license resulted to unaccentable outcomes.
- Code of conduct: Environmental, Social, Health and Safety (ESHS) did not submitted.
- Unprofessional Scheduling: Material, Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule did not prepared and submitted using project software.

### 5) Phexiros Masfin JV with Relish Trading

The bidder claimed project experience from a fictitious entity, "Engineering Corporation of Oromia", for the so-called Dodota SSIP, which amounts to fraudulent claims..

- Unrealistic Turnover: Average Annual construction turnover and annual turnover indicated information on letter from Ministry of Revenue Tax Payer Branch office did not coincided and unacceptable.
- Private Auditor's License Issue: The private auditor's lack of trade and professional license resulted to unacceptable outcomes.
- Unprofessional Scheduling: Material, Human Resource and Equipment Master Schedule did not prepared and submitted using project software.

## 6) IJOO Construction

- > Lack of Experience: General and Specific Experiences non-compliance with company establishment.
- Unrealistic Turnover: The Average Annual Construction Turnover and Average Annual Turnover letters from the Ministry of Revenue Tax Payer Branch office reveal noncompliance with company establishments, indicating fraud and forgery.
- Unprofessional Scheduling: Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule did not prepared and submitted via project software.

# 7) Abraham Dereje GC & GCWW

- Material, Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule did not prepared and submitted via project software.
- Audit Report Issue: The audit report, which was prepared by a private auditor who was not an authorized auditor but instead became an accountant, is not acceptable according to the requirement.
- Unsigned Expert CVs: All CV of expert did not authorized by signature of company owner or representative.
- Unlicensed Key Personnel: Social Specialist and Site Organizer have not professional license.

#### 8) Worknesh Gizaw WWC

- Average construction turnover and annual turnover did not meet the minimum requirement.
- Technical Planning Issues: Like many others, the implementation schedule was missing proper project software formatting in Material, Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule.
- Unsigned Expert CVs: All experts CV and project manager CV did not signed by experts themselves and by authorized company owner or representative.
- Tax Payer Evidence Issue: Tax Payer evidence letter and document of professionals and experts not submitted and justified from custom and revenue.
- Technical Planning Issues: Like many others, the implementation schedule was missing proper project software formatting in Material, Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule
- Unlicensed Key Personnel: The site organizer and social expert lacked valid licenses.

gu

n

Stocksmon Park

# 9) Kenbon Construction & Trading JV with Wak Construction & Trading PLC

- Lack of Joint Venture Experience: Wak Construction failed to present general experience independently, which is mandatory in a joint venture arrangement.
- > Technical Planning Issues: Like many others, the implementation schedule was missing proper project software formatting in Material, Human Resource, Cash Flow and Equipment Master Schedule
- > Unlicensed Key Personnel: The site organizer and social expert lacked valid licenses.

# 10) Awash Construction PLC

- > Missing Auditor Credentials: The audit firm did not submit a valid license.
- > Company Turnover Unfulfilled: Average turnover not met required amount.
- Cash Flow Scheduling Issue: No proper software-supported schedule for cash flow master schedule.

## 11) Muluneh Bekele JV with Yatani Construction PLC

- Incomplete Financial Access Statement: Only one JV partner submitted cash flow data, which is noncompliant—both parties should have done so collectively.
- Unsigned Expert CVs: Several professionals' CVs (e.g., Forman, Social Specialist and Organizer, Environmental, Climate and Safeguard Specialist) lacked the required company representative's countersignature.
- Expired/Doctored Professional License: One license (office engineer) was expired and appeared to be digitally altered, raising concerns about forgery.
- Fake Contract Agreement: The agreement between the company and its surveyor expert was valid for only one day, which is not acceptable under any professional arrangement.

# 12) Hilif Construction WWC-1 & GC-5

- The Letter of Bid was missing key information, including the proposed Adjudicator, as required under as per ITB BDS 49.1.
- Several mandatory fields in the Letter of Bid (e.g., #14) were left blank, despite clear instructions in as per ITB 9.4 requiring bidders to complete all forms. The failure to provide all essential information constitutes non-responsiveness.

gu.

w

\$mg





# 5.6. Recommendation of the Evaluation

Name & Signature of the Evaluation Committee

Accordingly, the evaluation team recommended that the lowest evaluated bid (preliminary, technical financial and Financial evaluation) successful bidder called Fenet Gemeda WWC-3 with the total price after arithmetic check of ETB 49,414, 892.65 (Forty Nine Million Four Hundred Fourteen Thousand Eight Hundred Ninety Two and 65/100).